

**UNDERSTANDING CHANGE AND CHANGE
MANAGEMENT PROCESSES: A CASE STUDY**

by

Carlo D'Ortenzio

Thesis submitted in fulfillment of requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy at the University of Canberra

Canberra, AUSTRALIA

9 August 2012

ABSTRACT

The central focus of this case study is to advance knowledge regarding employees' understanding of change and change management within a public sector organisation, namely, the South Australian Tourism Commission (SATC). This organisation, like other public sector organisations in Australia, has undergone and is currently undergoing a series of significant organisational changes, mainly due to mandates brought about by public sector reform policy. Present trends in change and change management in Australia, both at the federal and state level, reflect a sense of urgency on the part of governments to revitalise a Public Service that is able to sustain continuity and change. This is based on the premise that it is only through reform that the Australian Public Service will be able to address the challenges of a rapidly-changing world. However, this means that public sector employees are now called upon to adjust their thinking and practices to respond to the changing needs and expectations demanded of them by governments.

In view of the above, this case study sought to understand and represent employees' understandings regarding what influences effective change processes and how these have impacted upon them. This is not to imply that this study has engaged in critical policy analysis but rather it has analysed trends, both nationally and internationally, in order to ascertain the manner in which public sector organisations, more so those in South Australia, are embracing contemporary practices in the arena of change and change management and if so, at whose and what expense?

The study, conducted at grassroots level, spanned approximately six years and sought to give voice to those least often heard or asked, that is, public sector employees. The questions asked of participants in both the informal and formal interviews – as part of the data collecting process – were related to changes that the organisation was undergoing, how these changes were being implemented, and the influence that these changes were having on them. Insights about public sector reform were gained by questioning organisational change processes and practices, and for viewing and describing the meanings that employees created around their roles, professions, and organisation.

Adopting a qualitative research methodology, the research questions focused on seeking a deeper understanding of the complex issue of change and change management from the employees' viewpoints and was guided mainly by the following questions:

- How did employees within the SATC view change processes and practices within the current work dynamics of their organisation?
- What were employees understanding of the definitions of change and change management within the SATC?
- What were employees' experiences of change and change management within the SATC?
- What were employees' understanding of the term 'resistance to change' and the reasons as to whether employees resisted change initiatives in the SATC or not?
- What role did 'communication' play in the introduction and implementation of change and change management within the SATC?
- What role did managers/change initiators play in the change process within the SATC?
- How did employees view change and change management from a critical—bureaucratic or non-bureaucratic—perspective?

The secondary questions that informed the main research questions were:

- What were employees' expected roles in the change process with regard to the change initiatives being implemented in the SATC?
- To what extent were SATC employees afforded opportunities to contribute their expectations prior to, during and after the change process?
- What were the contributing factors to public sector reform and organisational and managerial change initiatives within the SATC?

During times of change, employees' understandings of change and change management are more readily apparent as they respond to the pressures of those changes. These understandings help to explain how individual employees construct meanings about their organisation, the changes affecting the organisation and themselves as members of the organisation.

Thus, through the data collected, the case study provided insights into understanding, identifying and describing how employees within the SATC perceived and constructed their organisation and managed their work lives, especially in times of change. Concerns surfaced during both the informal and formal interviews about the role of the employee, the needs of the organisation, the purposes of change and change management and related issues pertaining to public sector reform. At the same time, holding the organisational culture together were certain underlying values, characteristics, and expectations; mainly a commitment to the organisation and the best interests of the clients and customers.

The above concerns were evident in the findings from the informal interviews whereby employees' understanding of change and change management processes and practices differed to varying degrees. With regard to the findings from the formal interviews, the views echoed by employees provided a useful insight into what employees believed to be happening within the SATC with regard to change and change management. These views must be taken into consideration in order to create effective organizational change within the SATC.

Thus, understanding the dynamics between the existence of organisational change and the people who work in the organisation is important to policy makers. Also, whilst there is much literature on change and change management, little effort has been made to address and rectify the fears, concerns and expectations of these changes upon public sector employees. There is also limited evidence in the literature of the positive or negative aspects of change and change management from the employees' point of view – as recipients of change, because successful change and change management is dependent upon 'employee buy-in'.

In essence, this study demonstrates the need for public sector employees to have a 'voice' in change and change management processes and practices that affect them both on a personal and professional capacity.

Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Form B: Certificate of Authorship of Thesis</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xvii</i>
CHAPTER ONE: ORIENTATION TO THE STUDY	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background to the Study	2
1.3 General Methodology	6
1.4 Research Questions	7
1.5 General Objectives	8
1.6 Justification for the Case Study	8
1.7 Limitations of the Case Study	9
1.8 Envisioned Benefits of the Study	9
1.9 Thesis Outline	9
1.10 Summary	10
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 The Phenomenon of Change	14
2.3 Change Management – A Brief Overview of the Field	21
2.4 Reasons for Change	26
2.5 Models of and Approaches to Change and Change Management	30
2.5.1 Some key traditional models of change and change management	31
2.5.1.1 The planned approach to organisational change – Kurt Lewin’s model of change	31
2.5.1.2 The contingency model of change - Dunphy and Stace’s model of change	34

2.5.1.3 The emergent approach to organisational change – Kotter’s model of change	36
2.5.1.4 Mintzberg and Quinn’s model of change	39
2.5.1.5 Anderson and Anderson’s model of change	44
2.6 The Transformational Approach to Change and Change Management	53
2.6.1 Transformational change models	55
2.6.1.1 Practitioner models	55
2.6.1.2 Theoretical models	56
2.6.2 Transformational change and its implications for public sector organisations	57
2.6.2.1 The impact of transformational change in public sector organisations	58
2.7 Resistance to Change	60
2.7.1 Defining resistance	61
2.7.2 The nature and causes of resistance	62
2.7.3 Resistance in the public service sector	64
2.8 Summary	66
CHAPTER THREE: PUBLIC SECTOR CHANGE IN AUSTRALIA AND SOUTH AUSTRALIA	70
3.1 Introduction	70
3.2 Public Sector Change: An Australian Perspective	70
3.3 The Changing Nature of Organisational Change in the Australian Public Sector	74
3.4 New Public Management and its Implication for Change in Government Sector Organisations	76
3.4.1 Criticisms of New Public Management	80
3.5 Contemporary Trends in Australian Public Sector Management	82
3.6 A Chronology of Changes in the Australian Public Service (APS)	85
3.7 A Bureaucratic Approach to Public Sector Reform	94
3.8 A Critique of Organisational Change in the Australian Public Sector	96
3.9 Public Sector Change in the South Australian context	97
3.9.1 The Corbett Review – 1980	98
3.9.2 The Guerin Review – 1983 to 1984	99
3.9.3 The Public Sector Management Act 1995	100
3.9.4 A review of the South Australian Public Service	102
3.9.5 Review of the Office for the Commissioner for Public Employment –2004	103

3.9.6 South Australian public sector reform and renewal themes	104
3.10 Current Public Sector Reforms in South Australia	110
3.11 Change in the South Australian Tourism Commission	113
3.11.1 South Australian tourism directions (2003 - 2008)	114
3.11.2 South Australian Tourism Plan (2009 – 2014)	118
3.12 Summary	129
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	134
4.1 Introduction	134
4.2 Choosing an Appropriate Methodology	135
4.2.1 Epistemological considerations	136
4.2.2 The research design: case study method	138
4.2.3 Justification for the use of case study methodology in this study	139
4.3 Qualitative Methodology	141
4.3.1 What is qualitative research?	141
4.3.2 Some criticisms of qualitative research methods	143
4.3.3 Justification for the Use of Qualitative Methodology in this Case Study	144
4.4 The Interpretivist Approach to Inquiry	145
4.4.1 Assumptions of interpretive research	146
4.5 The Collection of Data Using Qualitative Methodology	150
4.5.1 The interview as a method of data collection	150
4.6 Ethical Considerations in this Case Study	153
4.6.1 The principle of informed consent	154
4.6.2 The right to anonymity and confidentiality	154
4.7 Selection of Participants	155
4.8 The Interview Process in this Case Study	155
4.9 Taping of Formal Interviews	157
4.10 Transcribing the Formal Interviews	157
4.11 ‘Ascertaining the Truth’ in this Case Study	158
4.12 Summary	159
CHAPTER FIVE: FINDINGS	160
5.1 Introduction	160
5.2 Findings from the Informal Interviews	160

5.2.1	Communication effectiveness	161
5.2.2	Company image	161
5.2.3	Conflict management	162
5.2.4	Human resource effectiveness	162
5.2.5	Managerial effectiveness	163
5.3.6	Mentoring and coaching	164
5.2.7	Organisation structure	165
5.2.8	Participation and teamwork	165
5.2.9	Role clarity	166
5.2.10	Confidence in management	166
5.2.11	Innovation	167
5.2.12	Employees' needs satisfaction	168
5.3	Findings from the Formal Interviews	168
5.3.1	Introduction	168
5.3.2	The informants	168
5.3.3	Emergence of major themes	169
5.3.3.1	Theme 1: An understanding of change and change management processes and practices	169
5.3.3.2	Theme 2: Employee's experiences of change and change management	172
5.3.3.3	Theme 3: Resistance to change	174
5.3.3.4	Theme 4: Communication	176
5.3.3.5	Theme 5: Managerial effectiveness	180
5.3.3.6	Theme 6: Change and change management: A top-down driven policy	181
5.4	Summary	184
	CHAPTER SIX: DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS	186
6.1	Introduction	186
6.2	Discussions from the Case Study Findings	186
6.3	Discussion of Findings: Informal Interviews	188
6.3.1	Communication effectiveness	190
6.3.2	Company image	192
6.3.3	Conflict management	193
6.3.4	Human resource effectiveness	195
6.3.5	Managerial effectiveness	198

6.3.6 Mentoring and coaching	199
6.3.7 Participation and teamwork	200
6.3.8 Role clarity	202
6.3.9 Innovation	203
6.3.10 Employees' needs satisfaction	205
6.3.11 Performance standards	206
6.3.12 Concluding remarks	207
6.4 Discussion of Findings: Formal Interviews	208
6.4.1 Theme 1: An understanding of change and change management	209
6.4.2 Theme 2: Employees' experiences of change and change management	214
6.4.3 Theme 3: Resistance to change	219
6.4.4 Theme 4: Communication in the South Australian Tourism Commission	224
6.4.5 Theme 5: Managerial effectiveness	232
6.4.6 Theme 6: Change and change management: A top-down driven policy	236
6.4.7 Concluding remarks – revisiting the site	239
6.4.8 Current views of change and change management in the SATC	240
6.5 Summary	246
CHAPTER SEVEN - CONCLUSION	248
7.1 Introduction	248
7.2. A Four-Step Model/Approach to Change in Public Sector Organisations	249
7.2.1 Step One: The effective introduction and communication of the change	252
7.2.2 Step Two: The execution and implementation of the organisational change	257
7.2.3 Step Three: Managing the environment of change	260
7.2.4 Step Four: Sustaining the change	264
7.3 Limitations and Scope for Further Study	271
7.4 Conclusion	272
BIBLIOGRAPHY	275
APPENDIX	321
1. Research Questions – Formal Interviews	321

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 The changing nature of the APS 2000-2010	88-91
Table 3.2 Direction of the South Australian Tourism Commission (2003-2008)	117
Table 3.3 South Australian Tourism Plan – Strategic Planning Process 2009-2014	120
Table 6. 1 Positive and negative aspects of conflict	194
Table 7.1 Barriers to Change	268

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 Kurt Lewin’s Model of Change	32
Figure 2.2 Dunphy and Stace’s Typology of Change	35
Figure 2.3 Kotter’s 8-Step Model of Change	37
Figure 2.4a The five basic components of an organisation	41
Figure 2.4b Organisational pulls	42
Figure 2.5 The Anderson and Anderson’s Model of Change	44
Figure 7.1 A four-step model of change for the SATC	249

Acknowledgements

Undertaking a PhD program was life changing for me in many ways and I need to thank the many people who have supported and guided me through this research experience.

First of all, I would like express my gratitude to my supervisor Associate Professor Doug Davies, without whom I would have not made this endeavor a success. His dedication to excellence and willingness to read through the many drafts, provide constructive criticism and guide me through the various stages of writing this thesis was invaluable. To my second supervisor, Professor Byron Keating his corrections and clarity of argument has helped keep the central research questions in focus throughout this study. There are many others who have helped me in this PhD scholarship and I am thankful for their input and support, more so to staff members of the Faculty of Business, Government and Law of the University of Canberra.

I acknowledge, with thanks, the professional editing done by Lulu Turner, copyeditor engaged by the Department of Business, Government and Law to support the work of its Higher Degree by Research students.

I appreciate the assistance of the host organisation and the research participants, who made themselves available to provide me with their insights, views, and ideas. I am forever grateful to my wife Enza for her continuous support and encouragement and to my beautiful children Vittoria, Luke and Isabella, thank you for your love, support and tolerance. Without this support from family, this thesis would never have been completed, and it is as much their accomplishment as mine.