



University of Canberra

This thesis is available in print format from the University of Canberra Library.

If you are the author of this thesis and wish to have the whole thesis loaded here, please contact the University of Canberra Library at *e-theses@canberra.edu.au* Your thesis will then be available on the www providing greater access.

Competency-Based Assessment in Australia - Does it work?

Nanikie Charity Mhlongo
B-Tech Post School Education,
Graduate Diploma in Professional Education
and Development

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of master of Human Resources
Development (HRD), Faculty of Education,
University of Canberra

March 2002

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to acknowledge several contributions which have enabled me to complete this thesis.

Firstly, I acknowledge and thank my supervisor Dr. Francesco Sofo for his time, valuable guidance, suggestions and inspiration throughout the study.

I would like to thank the staff and students at Canberra Institute of Technology, Department of Hospitality and Tourism for participating in the study. I would like to thank them for their time, patience and assistance in furnishing me with the necessary information for this study.

I would like to thank some members of the Hospitality industry in Canberra, I cannot name them but I would still like to thank them for their valuable time and patience during this study.

I would like to thank the staff at the University of Canberra Academic Skills Program for giving me valuable insight, support and assistance throughout the two years of my candidature.

I would like to thank my colleagues at Witwatersrand Technikon, Department of Food Service Management for their support and understanding of my absentia at work for the two years undertaking this study.

Finally, thank you to the Australian Mandela Scholarship administrators for the opportunity to undertake this study.

ABSTRACT

South Africa since the liberation in 1994 has faced a lot of changes. The changes include being a member of the international community. As part of the international community, South Africa is finding itself largely faced by the challenges associated with this position. Looking at other countries South Africa is realizing that the world is looking at better ways of educating their people and organizing their education and training systems so that they might gain the edge in an increasingly competitive economic global environment. Success and survival in such a world demands that South Africa has a national education and training system that provides quality learning and promotes the development of a nation that is committed to life-long learning.

Institutions of higher education in South Africa are currently changing their present education system to conform to a Competency-Based Training (CBT) system. This system has only been planned but not implemented yet and it is not clear how CBT will be implemented, especially how the learners are going to be assessed.

Competency-Based Assessment (CBA) is an integral part of CBT that needs particular attention if the new system is to succeed.

The key aims of this thesis are to investigate the current assessment policy and practice at the Canberra Institute of Technology (CIT) underpinned by Competency-Based Training system. The project will describe and analyze the Competency-Based Assessment system used within CIT's CBT system. The project will focus on: Observing classroom practice of CBA, analyzing students' and teachers' perceptions of their involvement with CBA, and analyzing employers' perceptions of the effectiveness of CBA.

The main aim of this thesis is to suggest recommendations for an assessment model that will be suitable to implement within hospitality training institutions in South Africa.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|------|
| DECLARATION | ii |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS..... | iii |
| TABLE OF CONTENTS..... | iv |
| LIST OF TABLES | ix |
| LIST OF FIGURES | x |
| LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS | xi |
| ABSTRACT..... | xiii |
| CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| Outcomes-Based Education (Competency-Based Training)and Assessment in South Africa..... | 1 |
| The problem which motivated the study..... | 4 |
| Purpose of the study..... | 5 |
| Scope of the study..... | 6 |
| Research questions and objectives..... | 7 |
| Research methods | 8 |
| Collecting information..... | 8 |
| Analysing and interpreting the information gathered..... | 8 |
| Limitation of the study..... | 9 |
| Significance of the study..... | 9 |
| CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE..... | 11 |
| Rationale for the topic covered in this thesis | 11 |
| Why competency-based training (CBT)?..... | 11 |
| Historical background..... | 12 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| What is competency-based training? | 12 |
| Essential features of the CBT approach | 13 |
| What makes CBT different from other education systems? | 14 |
| Assessment and competency-based assessment | 14 |
| What is competency-based assessment? | 14 |
| Purposes of assessment | 15 |
| Purposes of competency-based assessment | 15 |
| Types of competency-based assessment | 16 |
| Principles of assessment | 21 |
| What constitutes best practice in assessment? | 23 |
| Preparation and planning for assessment | 24 |
| How to assess? | 24 |
| Who does the assessment? | 25 |
| Involvement of candidates | 25 |
| Recording results | 26 |
| Providing feedback to the candidates being assessed | 26 |
| Grading under a competency-based system | 27 |
| An overview of the assessment process | 28 |
| Competency-based assessment issues | 28 |
| Benefits of CBA | 32 |
| Reviewing the assessment process | 33 |
| Other research | 33 |
| Conclusion | 35 |
| CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODS | 36 |
| The research question | 36 |
| Justification for adopting the case study method | 36 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Data sources | 37 |
| Pilot study | 38 |
| Survey questionnaire | 38 |
| Interview approach..... | 38 |
| Focus groups study..... | 39 |
| Researcher's participation..... | 40 |
| Case study | 40 |
| Maintaining ethical standards | 41 |
| CHAPTER 4 PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS | 42 |
| How the findings will be presented | 42 |
| Data from students | 42 |
| Survey questionnaire description | 42 |
| Findings of student data..... | 44 |
| Survey data | 44 |
| Interviews data | 50 |
| Focus group data | 53 |
| Data from lecturers | 57 |
| Survey questionnaire description | 57 |
| Findings in relation to lecturers | 58 |
| Interview data..... | 62 |
| Data from industry | 65 |
| Survey questionnaire description | 65 |
| Findings in relation to industry | 65 |
| Survey data | 65 |
| CHAPTER 5 INTERPRETATION OF FINDINGS..... | 70 |
| Interpreting the findings | 70 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Data analysis – students' perceptions of CBA..... | 70 |
| Summary of student data | 80 |
| Data Analysis-lecturers' perceptions of CBA..... | 81 |
| Summary of lecturers' data | 87 |
| Data analysis- Industry's perceptions of CBA | 87 |
| Competency-Based Training..... | 87 |
| Summary..... | 89 |
| Comparisons | 90 |
| CBA helpful to learning | 90 |
| Evidence of skills..... | 90 |
| Grading | 91 |
| Workplace Assessment..... | 92 |
| CBA over-assessing or under-assessing | 92 |
| Validity of assessment methods..... | 93 |
| Assessment criteria..... | 94 |
| Summary of the interpretations | 94 |
| Conclusion | 96 |
| CHAPTER 6 REVIEW, CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND DIRECTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH | 98 |
| About this chapter..... | 98 |
| Reviewing and discussing the results of the study | 98 |
| Lessons for South Africa | 105 |
| Recommendations of a model for CBA/T | 105 |
| Directions for future research | 106 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | 108 |
| APPENDIX 1 Cover letter to participants | 115 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| APPENDIX 1(continued) Consent form to students and lecturers | 116 |
| APPENDIX 1 (continued) Consent for for industry | 117 |
| APPENDIX 1 (continued) Participants'information | 118 |
| APPENDIX 1(continued) Questionnaire cover letter | 121 |
| APPENDIX 1(continued) Students' questionnaire | 122 |
| APPENDIX 1 (continued) Lecturers' questionnaire | 127 |
| APPENDIX 1 (continued) Industry questionnaire | 131 |
| APPENDIX 2 Interview guide (Lecturer)..... | 133 |
| APPENDIX 2 Interview guide (students) | 135 |
| APPENDIX 2 Interview guide (industry/employers)..... | 137 |

LIST OF TABLES

| | |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| Table 2.1: Summary of methods for assessing competency (Source: Masters & McCurry 1990:58)..... | 21 |
| Table 4.2: Summary of principles of assessment reported by students survey responses (n=56)..... | 46 |
| Table 4.3: Summary of the process of CBA reported by students' responses (n=56)..... | 47 |
| Table 4.4: Summary of perceptions of the CBA procedure (n=56)..... | 47 |
| Table 4.5: Summary of the forms of assessment (n=56)..... | 48 |
| Table 4.6: Summary of the qualifications the students will obtain at the completion of their course (n=56) | 48 |
| Table 4.7: Course attendance (n=56)..... | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 4.8: Gender and age range of student participants (n=56)..... | Error! Bookmark not defined. |
| Table 4.9: Typical interview responses by students, and percentages of positive and negative responses (n=20)..... | 50 |
| Table 4.10: Courses and the number of students in each course..... | 58 |
| Table 4.11: Lecturers' responses to questions about CBA principles (n=15)..... | 59 |
| Table 4.12: Lecturers' views of the CBA processes (n=15)..... | 59 |
| Table 4.13: summary of CBA procedure (n=15)..... | 60 |
| Table 4.14: Typical interview responses by lecturers, and percentages of positive and negative responses (n=10)..... | 62 |
| Table 4.15: Typical responses of industry's understanding of CBT approach in Vocational Education institutions..... | 65 |
| Table 4.16: Trades in which industry generally employs students..... | 66 |
| Table 4.17: Summary of the interview responses by industry (n=10)..... | 68 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| | |
|--|----|
| Figure 4. 1: Students' responses indicating awareness having been assessed using CBA (n=56) | 45 |
| Figure 4.2: Students' responses about CBA transparency (n=56)..... | 46 |
| Figure 4.3: Responses to how lecturers feel about CBA being objective (n=15)..... | 58 |
| Figure 4.4: Lecturers' view of whether the assessment criteria are easy to use..... | 58 |
| Figure 4.5: Whether a difference exists between assessment methods used in CBA and those used in other education approaches (lecturers' views) (n=15)..... | 60 |
| Figure 4.6: Responses regarding the existence of a procedure for monitoring industry standards (n=15). | 61 |
| Figure 4.7: industry's preference of students trained under CBT (n=10) | 66 |
| Figure 4.8: Students' readiness for work after completing their courses (n=10)..... | 66 |
| Figure 4.9: Responses of how industry perceives fairness of CBT/A system to students (n=10)..... | 67 |

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|--------|--|
| ACT | Australian Capital Territory |
| AEC | Australian Education Council |
| ANTA | Australian National Training Authority |
| AQF | Australian Qualifications Framework |
| ARF | Australian Recognition Framework |
| ASF | Australian Standard Framework |
| AVET | Australian Vocational Education and Training |
| CBA | Competency based assessment |
| CSB | Competency Standards Body |
| CBT | Competency based training |
| CIT | Canberra Institute of Technology |
| COSTAC | Commonwealth/State Training Advisory Committee |
| DEET | Department of Employment, Education and Training |
| DOE | Department of Education |
| DOLAC | Department of Labour Advisory Committee |
| MOVEET | Ministers of Vocational Education, Employment and Training |
| NFROT | National Framework for the Recognition of Training |

| | |
|-------|--|
| NOOSR | National Office of Overseas Skills Recognition of Training |
| NTB | National Training Board |
| NTRA | National Training Reform Agenda |
| NTF | National Training Framework |
| NTFC | National Training Framework Committee |
| NQF | National Qualifications Framework |
| OBE | Outcomes Based Education |
| QA | Quality Assurance |
| QETO | Quality Endorsed Training Organisation |
| QI | Quality Improvement |
| RPL | Recognition of Prior Learning |
| SAQA | South African Qualifications Authority |
| SRA | Skills Recognition Agency |
| STB | State Training Board |
| TAC | Training Accreditation Council |
| TAFE | Technical and Further Education |
| VET | Vocational Education and Training |
| WADT | Western Australia Department of Training |