
This thesis is submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Canberra

**TOWARD PUBLIC MANAGEMENT BY ENHANCING PUBLIC
SECTOR STRATEGIC PLANNING**

*Using Private Sector Planning Techniques to Improve Public Sector
Planning*

Juilinne Anton Wills

September 1999

Abstract

This thesis considers the problems associated with the Australian Public Sector moving sometimes erratically towards strategic public management following substantial and wide ranging reforms over the last 20 years. In particular, this study examines public organizational planning and evaluates the extent to which private sector planning philosophies and methodologies have already and could be applied more relevantly to the public sector. The major proposition is that commercial planning methods and techniques can be used selectively to enhance agency planning and management effectiveness and efficiency. A specific application at Centrelink is considered for public service providers delivering high quality government services as part of a purchaser/provider relationship. Strategic planning and management theory and models are reviewed and a progressive-stages model is developed for the APS. A range of private sector planning techniques and tools is evaluated and brief but classified case studies on major APS organizations are also presented. The thesis concludes that a dynamics capabilities approach would enable public organizations to maximize strategic management and operational effectiveness.

Dedication

I dedicate this work to my beloved wife Faye who is my rock and my constant inspiration and who supported and suffered my study.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I acknowledge greatly the wisdom, patience and sound advice of my doctoral supervisor and mentor, Dr Alan Jarman from the University of Canberra, in extending my intellectual reach and challenging my assumptions. His prodigious memory and ability to apply the lessons of history have assisted my studies and thought processes in extending theory and developing this thesis.

I also thank Dr John Halligan, Director of the Centre for Research in Public Sector Management, University of Canberra for his assistance and support over the years. My thanks also to my fellow doctoral students for sharing and easing the anguish and trepidations of doctoral research.

I wish to thank my supervisors, members of the executive and staff of the Department of Social Security and latterly Centrelink for their support and understanding during my study program over the years. A special vote of gratitude goes to Mr Ross Divett, Deputy Chief Executive of Centrelink for sharing his experience and giving valuable insights into the operations of a changing public sector.

I have also enjoyed the privilege of lecturing to Masters students in, among other units, Corporate Planning Techniques at the University of Canberra for several years for which I acknowledge the support and encouragement of Associate Professor Jim McMaster. As part of the unit evaluation process, students were required to apply planning models to both public and private organizations. My special thanks to the students of the 1998 unit who interviewed Centrelink staff and compiled preliminary research data as part of a class project in May/June 1998 within the framework I had provided. Senior Centrelink staff attended a class presentation and commented favourably on the limited findings of the exercise. Since that time I have updated the data significantly to complete a contemporary analysis of the organization for inclusion in this work.

Table of Contents

TOWARD PUBLIC MANAGEMENT BY ENHANCING PUBLIC SECTOR STRATEGIC PLANNING..	i
Abstract.....	ii
Dedication.....	ii
Certificate of Authorship of Thesis.....	iii
Copyright.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Table of Contents.....	vii
SECTION 1 THESIS INTRODUCTION AND PUBLIC MANAGEMENT TRENDS	1
Chapter 1 Introduction.....	2
Introduction	2
Background to Thesis Research – Public Management.....	3
Modelling Public Planning- Environment and Policy Making.....	7
Scope of the Thesis – Research Questions.....	11
Methodology.....	11
Structure of Thesis.....	13
Chapter 2 Developments and Trends in Public Management.....	15
Introduction	15
Early moves towards Public Management	15
The Contextual Nature of Managerialism.....	17
Implementing Change – FMIP and Beyond.....	20
Sectoral Differences and Public Management	23
Applying Private Sector Methods in the Public Service	27
Public Production Processes: The Professional ‘Rationalists’	30
The Public Managers and Implementation	32
Comparative Public Management Trends in the United Kingdom, New Zealand and United States	37
Trends in UK	40
Trends in New Zealand.....	42
Public Management Influences and Initiatives in the US.....	44
Developments and Trends in Australia	47
APS Managers	49
Beyond Bean Counting – Transforming APS Financial Management.....	50
Commonwealth Purchaser/Provider Arrangements	55
Summary.....	61
SECTION 2 STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT, STRATEGIC PLANNING EXPERIENCE AND MODELS FOR THE PUBLIC SECTOR	62
Chapter 3 Moving to Strategic Management in the Public Sector: Background Factors.....	63
Introduction	63
The Emergence of Strategic Management	64
History	66
Strategic Management Leadership.....	71
Strategy and Strategic Directions: Some Critiques	74
Strategic Decision Making.....	77
Benefits and Drawbacks of Strategic Management: Some Remarks.....	79
Models of Private Sector Strategic Management.....	82
Strategic Management Paradigms for the Public Sector	87
Cultural Dimensions within the APS Model.....	96
APS Strategic Management Framework	98
Summary.....	101

Chapter 4 Public Strategic Planning – Concepts And APS Experience.....	103
Introduction	103
Background.....	103
Strategic Planning - Concept and Definitions	105
Management and Planning.....	106
Strategic Planning and Management in the Public Sector.....	107
Public Planning Developments in the United States	109
US Government Performance and Results Act - Public Sector Strategic Planning.....	112
Planning in the Australian Federal Public Management Cycle	117
PMC Phase One - Planning Objectives and Strategies	119
PMC Phase Two - Budgeting and Operational Planning.....	122
PMC Phase Three - Implementation and Monitoring	124
PMC Phase Four - Reporting and Evaluation	125
Implementation and Impact of APS Corporate Planning in the 1990s: The Experience.....	126
The Australian Public Sector Reformed - Planning and Reporting.....	131
A Selective Review of Public Plans 1990-1998	135
Summary.....	139
Appendix: Public Planning Glossary	141
 Chapter 5 Strategic Planning Models and Techniques – Applications for the Public Sector.....	 142
Introduction	142
Advantages and Disadvantages of Public Strategic Planning	143
Strategic Planning Models	145
Public Service Board Model 1986.....	145
The Bryson Model.....	146
1998 DoFA Planning Model.....	151
The Hax Corporate Strategic Planning Model and Computer Application.....	154
Comparing the Models.....	158
Strategic Planning Techniques and Tools for Public Planners.....	159
Delphi Technique.....	160
Management by Objectives.....	162
Competitive Analysis.....	163
Situation Analysis - SWOT.....	167
Value Chain Analysis.....	169
Summary.....	172
Appendix: Summary of Planning Technique Impacts - Public Planning Aspects.....	174
 SECTION 3 CASE STUDIES OF DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SECURITY AND CENTRELINK AND THESIS CONCLUSIONS.....	 175
 Chapter 6 Planning in The Department of Social Security 1990–1997: Toward Centrelink	 176
Introduction	176
The 1990 Planning Environment	176
1990 DSS Strategic Planning Processes - Preparations	178
DSS Planning for 1990-2000.....	180
The 1990 DSS Strategic Plan - Content.....	184
The 1990 DSS Strategic Plan - Format.....	186
Lessons from DSS Strategic Planning in 1990	187
Review of Progress against the 1990 Plan	188
Revising the Plan: 1993-94.....	191
The Next Round 1994-1995	196
The 1995-2000 Plan Content and Format.....	199
1995 Planning Lessons and Comparisons with 1990 Planning.....	200
DSS Program and Business Plans 1995-2005.....	203
DSS Transitional Planning 1996-1997	206
Comment.....	209
Summary.....	211

Chapter 7 Separating And Transforming Service Delivery - Centrelink Strategic Planning Framework 1997.....	212
Introduction	212
Establishing Centrelink.....	212
Centrelink Structure and Operations.....	214
Centrelink Stakeholders	216
The Concept of Government One-Stop Shops.....	216
Purchaser/Provider Arrangements	220
Centrelink Strategic Framework 1997-2002.....	224
Summary.....	229
 Chapter 8 Centrelink’s Strategic Framework 1998-2003.....	 231
Introduction	231
Consolidating and Updating the Framework.....	231
The Move to Accrual Budgeting.....	233
Aspects of Centrelink Strategic Planning.....	235
Applying the Hax Model to Centrelink Planning.....	238
Centrelink Strategic Management Practices: Stage Three – Strategic Planning	244
Moving to Stage Four: Centrelink Strategic Management	248
Summary.....	251
 Chapter 9 Conclusions And Implications	 253
Introduction	253
Discussion.....	255
Conclusions about Research Questions	258
Implication for Theory.....	258
Implication for Policy and Practice.....	259
Implications for Public Service Managers	259
Further Research.....	260
 BIBLIOGRAPHY, REFERENCES AND ANNEXES.....	 262
Bibliography and References.....	263
 Annex A Selective Review of APS Strategic/Corporate Plans & Reviews of Plans for APS, Australian States and International Public Agencies.....	 283
 Annex B Applying the Hax Strategic Planning Model to Centrelink.....	 340