

**An Investigation into the Qualities of
Effective English Teacher Educators in Indonesia**

Didin Nuruddin Hidayat

A thesis submitted for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Education

University of Canberra

2017

ABSTRACT

Teacher educators play a crucial role in the education of teachers as they assist student teachers to develop skills and competence. However, little is known about the qualities of teacher educators, especially in the context of English teacher education in Indonesia. The present study aims to address the paucity of research in this field by determining the characteristics believed to ensure effective English teacher educators (ETEs), establishing teaching strategies that are effective, considering the challenges faced by ETEs as they seek to be effective, and identifying strategies for improving ETE's effectiveness.

To achieve these aims, a mixed-methods sequential exploratory approach was employed. The research considered the perceptions of three different groups, namely ETEs, in-service and pre-service English teachers. Data was obtained from 39 interviews and 540 subsequently completed closed questionnaires.

The qualitative findings showed that the characteristics of effective ETEs fell into four basic themes, namely Personal Competence, Pedagogical Skills, Interpersonal Skills and Subject Matter Knowledge. The quantitative findings showed that each of the three groups participating in this study attached different levels of importance to these four themes.

For effective teaching strategies, two types of strategies were explored: inside and outside the classroom. For effective teaching strategies inside the classroom, the qualitative findings revealed three themes: (1) Diverse Approaches to Classroom Teaching, (2) Learner Autonomy, and (3) Authentic and Engaging Learning. The quantitative findings showed that each participating group had somewhat different views. For effective teaching strategies outside the classroom, the qualitative findings revealed two themes, namely (1) Collaborative and Participative Learning and (2) Students' Independence in Learning. The quantitative findings revealed that each participating group rated the second set of strategies as being more important than the first.

In terms of the challenges ETEs encounter, the qualitative findings revealed two dominant themes on this matter: (1) Supporting Resources and (2) Teaching Environment. The quantitative findings showed that the participants acknowledged a high level of agreement regarding all the challenges identified in the qualitative findings.

For strategies to improve ETEs' effectiveness, three types were explored: ETEs' personal initiatives, institutional support and government support. The qualitative findings revealed

specific themes for each. In regard to ETEs' personal initiatives, the qualitative findings revealed three themes, namely (1) *Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi* (Three Obligations of Higher Education), (2) Personal Capacity Building, and (3) Networking and Sharing. In regard to institutional support, the qualitative findings revealed three themes: (1) Funding and Facilities, (2) Collaboration, and (3) Evaluation. For government support, the qualitative findings revealed three themes, namely (1) Funding, (2) Professional Development and Partnerships Programs, and (3) Policy. The quantitative findings showed that participants acknowledged that the strategies identified in the qualitative findings were important for improving their effectiveness.

This study contributes to the growing understanding of the qualities that make ETEs effective. The findings might also be useful as a starting point for establishing a standard of competence for ETEs in the Indonesian context and other similar contexts. The results of this study highlighted the importance of applying teaching strategies, both inside and outside the classroom. Applying the two types of strategy is essential to, for example, compensate for the status of English as a foreign language in Indonesia and the low level of exposure to English the students have. The findings about ETEs' challenges contribute to identifying the areas where improvement is needed. The findings emphasise that most challenges are beyond ETEs' control. Hence, collaboration among ETEs, the teaching/learning institutions, and the government is viewed as a potential approach to solve some of the challenges and improve ETEs' effectiveness.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This PhD journey has been significant and extremely beneficial to my professional development as a teacher educator. After experiencing countless ups and downs, finally I have come this far. Now it is time for me to extend my highest appreciation to the many individuals involved.

My first and foremost gratitude goes to my primary supervisor, Dr. Deborah Hill. Her mind-stimulating supervision, constructive feedback and constant support have greatly assisted me in completing this study. She was always available to give advice and assistance during the entire period of my PhD study. I also thank her for always believing that I could get through this. My next gratitude goes to my secondary supervisor, Dr. Jeremy Jones who constantly provides support, encouragement and insight at every stage of my candidature. His point of view and advice provided me with invaluable insights during the writing process. Both my supervisors really supported me with excellent thesis supervision. I also would like to express my sincere thanks to Beth Barber. She has meticulously edited the thesis. Her professional editing service is exceptional.

My sincere appreciation is also directed to the Indonesian government, especially the Ministry of Religious Affairs for providing me a full scholarship and other financial support. Without this generous support, my dream to pursue a doctorate degree would have remained a dream. I also thank all participants involved in this study and several friends who helped me during my data collection stages. I also thank my PhD colleagues at the University of Canberra for their friendship and fruitful discussions.

Finally, I am forever grateful to my loving family. Thanks to my wonderful parents who have supported me for all the time. I still can vividly recall how difficult it was for me to be able to

complete even my secondary education, but my parents' huge support made it possible. Thank you, mom and dad, for always mentioning my name in your daily midnight prayers. I gave the special honor and privilege to my mom and dad of pressing the thesis submission button. I dedicate the completion of this thesis to them. My gratitude also goes to my big family who were always willing to support me anytime. My special thanks definitely go to my little family. To my wife, Choirunnisa, and my two growing kids, Haura and Farrel: thank you for being the source of my strengths and thank you for consistently understanding that some of our weekends just had to be normal weekdays.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	i
CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP OF THESIS	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xiii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xv
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Background of the Study	3
1.2.1 Overview of English Language Teaching (ELT) in Indonesia	3
1.2.2 Research Studies in English Teacher Education in Indonesia	5
1.2.3 Rationale for a New Study	12
1.3 Statement of the Problem	14
1.4 Purpose of the Study	14
1.5 Overview of Methods	15
1.6 Research Questions	16
1.7 Definitions of Terms	17
1.8 Significance and Contribution of the Study	18
1.9 Structure of the Thesis	20
1.10 Summary	21
CHAPTER II: LITERATURE REVIEW	23
2.1 Introduction	23
2.2 Context of the Study	23
2.2.1 Indonesian Education System	24
2.2.2 Status and Role of English in Indonesia	26

2.2.3 English Language Teaching (ELT) in Indonesia	27
2.2.4 English Teacher Education in Indonesia.....	34
2.2.4.1 Historical Development of Teacher Education in Indonesia	34
2.2.4.2 Pathways to English Teacher Education in Indonesia	35
2.2.4.3 English Teacher Education Curriculum in Indonesia	36
2.2.5 The Higher Education Institution Profiles	39
2.3 Theoretical Concept of Effective Teaching	40
2.3.1 Defining Effective Teaching.....	40
2.3.2 Characteristics of Effective Teaching.....	43
2.3.3 Effective Teaching Strategies	45
2.3.3.1 Effective Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	47
2.3.3.2 Effective Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	50
2.4 Theoretical Concept of Effective Teachers	53
2.4.1 History of Research into the Characteristics of Effective Teachers.....	54
2.4.1.1 Research Studies outside the Domain of English Language Teaching (ELT).....	54
2.4.1.2 Research Studies inside the Domain of English Language Teaching (ELT).....	57
2.4.2 Establishing the Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators	63
2.4.2.1 Pedagogical Skills	65
2.4.2.2 Subject Matter Knowledge.....	68
2.4.2.3 Interpersonal Skills.....	70
2.4.2.4 Personal Competence	72
2.4.3 Measuring Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators Based on Experience	73
2.4.4 The Need for Developing a Standard for English Teacher Educator in Indonesia	75
2.4.5 Challenges Confronting Teachers in Indonesia	78
2.4.6 Strategies for Improving Teacher Quality	81
2.5 Research Gap in the Literature	86
2.6 Summary	88
CHAPTER III: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	91
3.1 Introduction	91
3.2 Two Major Approaches to Research	91
3.2.1 Qualitative Research.....	91
3.2.2 Quantitative Research.....	93
3.2.3 Debates between the Two Approaches	94
3.2.4 Combining the Two Approaches – A Mixed Methods Approach	96
3.3 Research Approach	98
3.3.1 Definition and Designs of Mixed Methods Approach	98

3.3.2 Characteristics of Mixed Methods Approach	100
3.4. Research Design	101
3.4.1 Rationale.....	101
3.4.2 Research Steps.....	102
3.4.3 Validity and Reliability Issues.....	107
3.4.4 Ethical Considerations	108
3.4.4.1 Ethical Considerations of the Present Research Study	108
3.5 Research Participants, Data Collection Instruments & Procedure	110
3.5.1 Qualitative Phase	110
3.5.2 Quantitative Phase	117
3.6. Data Management	122
3.6.1 Qualitative Data Management	122
3.6.2 Quantitative Data Management	123
3.7. Approaches to Data Analysis	124
3.7.1 Qualitative Data Analysis	124
3.7.2 Quantitative Data Analysis	128
3.8. Summary	129
CHAPTER IV: RESULTS OF QUALITATIVE DATA	131
4.1 Introduction	131
4.2 Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators	131
4.2.1 Pedagogical Skills.....	134
4.2.1.1 Planning.....	134
4.2.1.2 Delivery.....	140
4.2.1.3 Organization	151
4.2.1.4 Evaluation.....	157
4.2.2 Personal Competence.....	160
4.2.3 Interpersonal Skills	169
4.2.4 Subject Matter Knowledge	174
4.3 Effective Teaching Strategies	178
4.3.1 Effective Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	178
4.3.1.1 Diverse Approaches to Classroom Teaching.....	179
4.3.1.2 Learner Autonomy	182
4.3.1.3 Authentic and Engaging Learning.....	183
4.3.2 Effective Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	185
4.3.2.1 Collaborative and Participative Learning	186

4.3.2.2 Students' Independence in Learning	189
4.4 Challenges in Attempting to be Effective.....	192
4.4.1 Supporting Resources	192
4.4.2 Teaching Environment.....	194
4.5 Strategies for Improving English Teacher Educators' Effectiveness.....	197
4.5.1 English Teacher Educators' Personal Initiatives	197
4.5.1.1 Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi	198
4.5.1.2 Personal Capacity Building	199
4.5.1.3 Networking and Sharing.....	201
4.5.2 Institutional Support	202
4.5.2.1 Funding and Facilities	202
4.5.2.2 Collaboration.....	204
4.5.2.3 Evaluation.....	205
4.5.3 Government Support.....	206
4.5.3.1 Funding.....	207
4.5.3.2 Professional Development and Partnerships Programs	208
4.5.3.3 Policy.....	209
4.6 Summary	210
CHAPTER V: RESULTS OF QUANTITATIVE DATA.....	213
5.1 Introduction	213
5.2 Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators (ETEs).....	213
5.2.1 Participants Perceptions Regarding the Most Important Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators	214
5.2.1.1 English Teacher Educators' Perceptions	214
5.2.1.2 In-Service English Teachers' Perceptions	215
5.2.1.3 Pre-Service English Teachers' Perceptions	215
5.2.2 Statistical Differences in Participants' Perceptions of Characteristics	216
5.2.3 Pre-service English Teachers' Perceptions of Characteristics Depending on Year of Study	219
5.2.4 In-service English Teachers' Perceptions of Characteristics Depending on Years of Teaching Experience	221
5.2.5 English Teacher Educators' Perceptions of Characteristics Depending on Years of Teaching Experience	223
5.3 Effective Teaching Strategies	225
5.3.1 Effective Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	225
5.3.2 Effective Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	229
5.4 Challenges in Attempting to be Effective.....	232

5.5 Strategies for Improving English Teacher Educators’ Effectiveness	234
5.5.1 English Teacher Educators’ Personal Initiatives	234
5.5.2 Institutional Support	236
5.5.3 Government Support.....	238
5.6 Integrating the Qualitative and Quantitative Findings of the Study	240
5.7 Summary	244
CHAPTER VI: DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS	245
6.1 Introduction	245
6.2. The Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators	245
6.2.1 Pedagogical Skills.....	247
6.2.2 Personal Competence.....	251
6.2.3 Interpersonal Skills	253
6.2.4 Subject Matter Knowledge	255
6.2.5 Differences in the Three Groups’ Perceptions on the Characteristics of Effective English Teacher Educators	257
6.3 Effective Teaching Strategies	269
6.3.1 Effective Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	269
6.3.2 Effective Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	274
6.4 Challenges in Attempting to be Effective	280
6.5 Strategies for Improving English Teacher Educators’ Effectiveness	287
6.5.1 English Teacher Educators’ Personal Initiatives	287
6.5.2 Institutional Support	291
6.5.3 Government Support.....	295
6.6 Summary	299
CHAPTER VII: CONCLUSION	301
7.1 Introduction	301
7.2 An Overview of the Study	301
7.3 Summary of the Major Findings	304
7.4 Theoretical and Practical Implications	309

7.5 Limitations of the Study	312
7.6 Recommendations for Future Research Directions	314
7.7 Conclusion of the Study	315
REFERENCES	317
APPENDICES	351
Appendix 1: Ethics Clearance	351
Appendix 2: Sample of Institution Approval	353
Appendix 3: Information Sheet	355
Appendix 4: Consent Form	357
Appendix 5: Interview Protocols	359
Appendix 6: Sample of Interview Transcript	369
Appendix 7: Questionnaires	379

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2. 1 Summary of the findings of research studies exploring effective teacher characteristics...	62
Table 3. 1 Research Steps.....	105
Table 3. 2 Demographic Information of PETs in the Qualitative Phase.....	111
Table 3. 3 Demographic Information of IETs in the Qualitative Phase.....	111
Table 3. 4 Demographic Information of ETEs in the Qualitative Phase.....	112
Table 3. 5 Demographic Information of PETs in the Quantitative Phase.....	117
Table 3. 6 Demographic Information of IETs in the Quantitative Phase.....	118
Table 3. 7 Demographic Information of ETEs in the Quantitative Phase.....	119
Table 4. 1 Characteristics of Effective ETEs.....	132
Table 4. 2 Effective Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	179
Table 4. 3 Effective Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	186
Table 4. 4 ETEs' Challenges.....	192
Table 4. 5 ETEs' Personal Initiatives.....	197
Table 4. 6 Institutional Support.....	202
Table 4. 7 Government Support.....	206
Table 5. 1 Descriptive Statistics for ETEs.....	214
Table 5. 2 Descriptive Statistics for IETs.....	215
Table 5. 3 Descriptive Statistics for PETs.....	216
Table 5. 4 Descriptive Statistics for All Groups.....	216
Table 5. 5 Results of ANOVAs and Effect Sizes (All Groups).....	218
Table 5. 6 Results of LSD Post Hoc (All Groups).....	218
Table 5. 7 Results of ANOVAs and Effect Sizes (PETs).....	220
Table 5. 8 Results of LSD Post Hoc (PETs).....	221
Table 5. 9 Results of the T-Test and Effect Sizes (IETs).....	223
Table 5. 10 Results of the T-Test and Effect Sizes (ETEs).....	225
Table 5. 11 Comparison of Mean Scores of Effective Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	227
Table 5. 12 Mean Scores of the Itemised Teaching Strategies inside the Classroom.....	228
Table 5. 13 Comparison of Mean Scores of Effective Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	230
Table 5. 14 Mean Scores of the Itemised Teaching Strategies outside the Classroom.....	231
Table 5. 15 Challenges ETEs Encountered in Their Attempts to be Effective.....	233
Table 5. 16 Mean Scores of the Itemised Challenges.....	233
Table 5. 17 ETEs' Personal Initiatives.....	235
Table 5. 18 Mean Scores for the Itemised Strategies in ETEs' Personal Initiatives.....	235
Table 5. 19 The Institutional Support.....	237
Table 5. 20 Mean Scores for the Itemised Strategies in the Institutional Support.....	237
Table 5. 21 The Government Support.....	239
Table 5. 22 Mean Scores for the Itemised Strategies in the Government Support.....	239

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ASEAN	:	Association of South East Asian Nations
BAN-PT	:	<i>Badan Akreditasi Nasional-Perguruan Tinggi</i> (National Accreditation Board of Higher Education)
CBC	:	Competency-Based Curriculum
CLT	:	Communicative Language Teaching
D1		Diploma 1
D2		Diploma 2
EFL	:	English as a Foreign Language
ELT	:	English Language Teaching
ETE(s)	:	English Teacher Educator(s)
EYL	:	English for Young Learner
FKIP	:	<i>Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan</i> (Faculty of Teacher Training and Education)
HE	:	Higher Education
ICT	:	Information and Communication Technology
IET(s)	:	In-service English Teacher(s)
IKIP	:	<i>Institut Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan</i> (Institute of Teacher Education)
KTSP	:	<i>Kurikulum Tingkat Satuan Pendidikan</i> (School-Based Curriculum)
MoEC	:	The Ministry of Education and Culture
MoRA	:	The Ministry of Religious Affairs
MoRTHE	:	The Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education
PET(s)	:	Pre-service English Teacher(s)
PISA	:	Program for International Student Assessment
PPG	:	<i>Program Pelatihan Guru</i> (Teachers Training Program)
SGA	:	<i>Sekolah Guru A</i> (School of Teacher-Level A)
SGB	:	<i>Sekolah Guru B</i> (School of Teacher-Level B)
SGO	:	<i>Sekolah Guru Olahraga</i> (School of Sports Teacher)
SPG	:	<i>Sekolah Pendidikan Guru</i> (School of Teacher Education)
SPSS	:	Statistical Package for Social Science