

# **Safety in Design: A Study of Designer's Motivation in Canberra, Australia**

Alexander Sherrard

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Canberra, Australian Capital Territory, Australia

Institute for Governance and Policy Analysis

February 2018

## **Abstract**

Construction is a high-risk occupation, and more needs to be done to increase safety. Traditionally, the responsibility for construction safety has been with the builder. To further improve construction safety, there is a need to look upstream into the design phase. Safety hazard identification during the design phase, referred to as Safety in Design (SID), can influence worker injuries, improves design quality and delivers long-term economic benefits. However, despite the known benefits of SID and proposed ways forward, studies have shown designers lack the motivation to implement SID. Little is understood about why there is a lack of motivation, and how to best motivate designers to implement SID. To address the knowledge gap, this research uses self-determination theory (SDT), a motivational theory that differentiates six different levels of motivation, to investigate the designer's motivation and makes recommendations aimed to improve SID implementation. Semi-structured interviews with 16 architects and 14 engineers from Canberra Australia were undertaken to better understand the perceived benefits of SID for the construction industry, the barriers inhibiting SID and the current motivation of designers to increase SID implementation. The research found that: designers lack an awareness and value of the SID concept; designers lack clarity on how to implement SID; there is a lack of enforcement and incentive for designers to increase SID implementation; and, there is a low safety culture within the design industry. Based on these findings, a Safety in Design Motivational Model (SIDMM) was established to help motivate designers to implement SID. The SIDMM informed five key recommendations to practice: 1) create awareness of the SID concept and legislation; 2) identify the value of SID to the designer; 3) increase the designer's knowledge of how to implement SID; 4) improve the safety culture of the design industry by aligning culture improvement with the SIDMM; and, 5) enforce SID where it is deliberately ignored.

## Acknowledgements

The completion of this thesis has been extremely challenging but also rewarding and I could not have finished it without the support of a great many people. It is to these people I would like to express my gratitude here.

I have been privileged to work with three amazing supervisors throughout my candidacy. Each one took a keen interest in my field of study and gave their full emotional and academic support. My initial primary supervisor was Professor Patrick Zou. Patrick believed in me enough to provide the encouragement and direction I needed to start my thesis. After Patrick's relocation interstate, my secondary supervisor, Professor Richard Hu, became my new primary supervisor. I am extremely grateful for his encouragement, guidance and continued belief in me. Richard's wisdom, enthusiasm and academic support gave me the inspiration to continue. My third supervisor, Doctor Lain Dare, accepted the request to become my secondary supervisor after Patrick's move. Lain, who's valuable advice was dispensed with unflagging and endless energy, was a privilege to work with.

I would also like to note the support and encouragement of my university faculty, the Institute for Governance and Policy Analysis (IGPA). Academic guidance combined with regular social activities made my time at IGPA inspirational, enjoyable and memorable. I would especially like to thank colleagues: Nilima Mathai; Sajeda Tuli; Justin Wilson; Mark Evans; and, David Marsh.

Another sincere thank you goes to the Institute of Architects Canberra chapter president, who saw the merit in this research and gave his and the institute's full support.

I would also like to give a warm thanks to the design organisations that allowed access to their designers and especially to the participants who generously made time in their busy lives to share their experiences.

My final expression of thanks is most importantly for my family. I would firstly like to thank my parents, Owen and Jane, for their unwavering encouragement and support and being the inspiration for me to always challenge myself. One of my greatest wishes was for my mother to attend my graduation, however due to illness, this will not be the case, she would have been so proud. Finally, heartfelt thanks to my children Emma, Zoe and Ben and special thanks to my wife, Angela. I am forever grateful for your encouragement and never doubting

my ability to finish. I am indebted also for enabling me to commit the time needed to complete this huge task.

I wish to dedicate this thesis to my late mother Jane, who played an integral role in my life so far, and would have loved nothing more than to have been at my graduation.

## **Publications**

Sherrard, A (2017) Safety In Design: A Study Of Designer's Motivation In Canberra Australia. In: *CIB W099 & TG59 International Safety, Health, and People in Construction Conference*, 11-13 June 2017, Cape Town SA.

## **Other Publications**

Zou, P.X.W., Marsh, D., Evans M., Sherrard, A. and Howard, J. (2014), Changing Construction Safety Culture and Improving Safety Performance by Design Thinking and Co-production: Research Proposal and Preliminary Results, *Proceeding of CIB W99 Achieving Sustainable Construction Health and Safety*, 2-3 June 2014, Lund Sweden, 126 - 136.

Zou, P. & Sherrard, A. (2014) *Safety Leadership. Advanced Observations & Conversations Skills Training. An Evaluation Report*, Canberra, University of Canberra.

## Table of Contents

Abstract .....	i
Certificate of Authorship of Thesis.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	v
Publications .....	vii
Other Publications.....	vii
List of Tables .....	xiii
List of Figures.....	xv
Abbreviations.....	xvii
1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 The Problem .....	1
1.2 Research Aims and Questions .....	5
1.3 Methods.....	5
1.4 Research Contribution.....	6
1.5 Organisation of the Thesis.....	8
1.6 Summary .....	9
2 LITERATURE REVIEW .....	11
2.1 Designer’s Safety in Design Obligation.....	11
2.2 Definition of Designer.....	15
2.3 Benefits of Safety in Design.....	16
2.4 Barriers to Safety in Design .....	17
2.5 Safety in Design Tools and Methodologies .....	21
2.6 Suggestions to Increase Safety In Design .....	26
2.7 Motivation Theory .....	31
2.7.1 Mini-Theories of Motivation.....	31
2.7.2 Self-Determination Theory.....	35
2.8 Summary .....	44

3	RESEARCH METHODS .....	45
3.1	Motivation Theory as a Lens .....	45
3.2	Research Design .....	46
3.3	Case Study .....	47
3.4	Data Collection .....	49
3.5	Data Analysis.....	52
3.6	Summary .....	55
4	RESEARCH FINDINGS.....	57
4.1	Benefits and Barriers to Safety in Design .....	57
4.2	Emergence of Themes.....	59
4.2.1	Theme One - Awareness .....	60
4.2.2	Theme Two - Clarity.....	68
4.2.3	Theme Three – Incentive.....	75
4.2.4	Theme Four - Enforcement .....	80
4.2.5	Theme Five - Culture .....	85
4.2.6	Theme Six - Value .....	90
4.3	Summary .....	94
5	DEVELOPING THE SAFETY IN DESIGN MOTIVATION MODEL .....	97
5.1	Definition of Safety in Design.....	97
5.2	Motivation Theory as a Lens .....	98
5.3	Self-Determination Theory Informs Safety in Design.....	104
5.4	Safety in Design Motivational Model Established .....	104
5.5	Safety in Design Motivation Model Stage One.....	107
5.5.1	Stage One - Awareness .....	107
5.5.2	Stage One - Value.....	107
5.5.3	Stage One - Incentive.....	107
5.6	Safety in Design Motivation Model Stage Two .....	108

5.6.1	Stage Two - Clarity.....	108
5.6.2	Stage Two – Safety Culture.....	109
5.7	Safety in Design Motivation Model – Stage Three .....	110
5.7.1	Stage Three - Enforcement.....	110
5.8	Summary .....	112
6	RECOMMENDATIONS ON PRACTICE.....	113
6.1	Recommendation One.....	114
6.1.1	Increased Collaboration .....	114
6.1.2	Improved Safety Training .....	116
6.2	Recommendation Two .....	116
6.2.1	Financial Benefit.....	117
6.2.2	Social Responsibility .....	117
6.2.3	Legal Obligation to Implement Safety in Design.....	118
6.2.4	Quality of Design.....	119
6.3	Recommendation Three .....	119
6.3.1	Safety in Design Education .....	120
6.3.2	Early Commencement.....	120
6.3.3	Appointment of Safety in Design Co-ordinator .....	121
6.3.4	Improve Construction Knowledge.....	121
6.4	Recommendation Four .....	123
6.4.1	Management Support for Culture Change .....	124
6.4.2	Focus on Ethics and Morals of Implementing Safety in Design.....	124
6.4.3	Align Safety Culture Improvement with SID Motivational Model.....	125
6.5	Recommendation Five .....	126
6.5.1	Inclusion in Building Approval Process .....	127
6.5.2	Appoint Safety in Design Co-ordinator .....	128
6.5.3	Inclusion in Designer’s Contract .....	128



6.5.4	Compliance with Quality Assurance System .....	129
6.5.5	Industry Association De-Registration.....	129
6.6	Summary .....	130
7	CONCLUSION .....	131
7.1	Overview of Main Findings .....	131
7.2	Achievement of Research Aims .....	133
7.3	Recommendations to Practice .....	136
7.4	Research Contributions and Implications .....	136
7.5	Research Limitations.....	138
7.6	Recommendations for Future Research .....	138
8	REFERENCES.....	141
9	APPENDIXES .....	163
9.1	Appendix One.....	163
9.2	Appendix Two .....	165

## List of Tables

Table 1 - Benefits of SID .....	16
Table 2 - Barriers to SID .....	18
Table 3 – Safety in Design Tools and Methodologies .....	22
Table 4 - Suggestions to Increase SID .....	26
Table 5 - Participant Identifier Codes .....	51
Table 6 – Node Coding Report.....	53
Table 7 – Verification of Known Benefits and Barriers .....	58
Table 8 - Major Themes in Relation to Designer’s Motivation .....	59
Table 9 - Sub Themes to Awareness.....	61
Table 10 - Sub Themes to Clarity .....	69
Table 11 - Sub Themes to Incentive .....	76
Table 12 - Sub Themes to Enforcement.....	81
Table 13 - Sub Theme to Culture.....	86
Table 14 - Sub Themes for Value .....	91
Table 15 - Recommendations to Practice.....	113
Table 16 – SIDMM Alignment with Culture Ladder (Hudson, 2007) .....	126
Table 17 – Main Research Findings .....	132
Table 18 – Key Recommendations to Practice.....	136
Table 19- Interview Questions.....	163
Table 20- Jurisdictional Progress of Model WHS Laws (Safe Work Australia, 2016c) .....	165

## List of Figures

Figure 1 – Designer’s Ability to Influence Safety (Szymberski, 1997).....	3
Figure 2 - Safety in Design Motivational Model.....	7
Figure 3 - The Self-Determination Continuum (Ryan & Deci, 2000).....	41
Figure 4 - Principles of SDT.....	46
Figure 5 - Sample of Mind Mapping used in Study.....	54
Figure 6 - Factors Inhibiting SID Awareness.....	60
Figure 7 – Factors Inhibiting Clarity of SID Implementation.....	68
Figure 8 – Factors Inhibiting Safety in Design Incentive.....	75
Figure 9 – Factors Inhibiting SID Enforcement.....	80
Figure 10 – Factors Inhibiting Safety Culture.....	85
Figure 11 – Factors Inhibiting SID Value.....	90
Figure 12 - Self-determination Continuum (Kusurkar et al., 2013).....	99
Figure 13 - Psychological Needs Required for Self-Determination.....	100
Figure 14 - Designers Current Level of Motivation.....	103
Figure 15 - Designers Required Level of Motivation.....	104
Figure 16 - Safety in Design Motivation Model.....	105
Figure 17 - Controlled Levels of Motivation.....	111
Figure 18 - Safety in Design Motivation Model.....	135

## Abbreviations

ACT	Australian Capital Territory
AIA	Australian Institute of Architects
BIM	Building Information Modelling
BCA	Building Code of Australia
CHAIR	Construction Hazard Assessment and Implication Review
CET	Cognitive Evaluation Theory
CPD	Continuing Professional Development
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
EA	Engineers Australia
ERIC	Eliminate Reduce Inform Control
ES	Decision Support Expert System
LCS	Life Cycle Safety
OIT	Organismic Integration Theory
PM	Project Manager
QA	Quality Assurance
ROAD	Risk and Opportunity at Design
SDT	Self-Determination Theory
SID	Safety in Design
SIDMM	Safety in Design Motivational Model
SWMS	Safe Work Method Statement
ToolSHeD	Tool for Safety and Health in Design
WHS	Workplace Health and Safety