

**THE ROLE OF SUBJECTIVITY IN INTELLIGENT
SYSTEMS COMMUNICATION AND LEARNING**

by

Renzo Gobbin

A Doctoral Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Information Sciences by Research

University of Canberra

School of Information Sciences and Engineering

September 2011

© Renzo Gobbin - All Rights Reserved

A b s t r a c t

The role of subjectivity in intelligent systems communication and learning

by Renzo Gobbin

This thesis examines the role of subjectivity in intelligent systems communication interfaces. It explores new models of software agent architectures able to provide agents with subjectivity and egocentric communication patterns.

A qualitative approach has been utilised using disciplines such as Intelligent Systems, Philosophy, and Cognitive Sciences.

The research results aim to increase knowledge of the subjective intelligent systems communication internal processes modelling, so improving the design of human-intelligent agent interface tools.

This research may be applied to intelligent agent and knowledge systems adopting subjective and egocentric communication in areas such as analysis of security intelligence, legal argument analysis and intelligent web search engines.

Table of Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	<i>ii</i>
<i>Form B</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>List of figures</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>viii</i>
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction & Motivation	1
1.2 Research Problem	5
1.3 Background	6
1.4 Research Questions	11
1.5 Research Objectives	12
1.6 Research Relevance	13
1.7 Theoretical Stance	15
1.8 Research Methodology	17
1.9 Thesis organisation and layout	19
Chapter 2: Literature Review	21
2.1 Literature review introduction	21
2.2 Why subjective communication is an important research topic	23
2.3 Software Agents communication overview. What is known?	25
2.4 Mediated communication activity	31
2.5 Current issues in software agent modelling and architectures	34
2.6 Agents learning, cognition and consciousness	36
2.7 Subjective communication, what is unknown on this research area	36
2.8 The knowledge gap we are trying to fill	38
2.9 Chapter Summary	40
Chapter 3: Activity Theory and Intelligent Systems Communication	41
3.1 Intelligence and Tool Mediated Activity.	41
3.2 The development of concepts in artificial intelligent systems	43
3.3 Intelligent tool mediated communication activities	45
3.4 Development of Artificial Intelligent Systems Knowledge	49
3.5 Chapter Summary	50
Chapter 4: Subjective Communication Issues	51
4.1 Subjective Intelligent Communication	51
4.2 Intelligent Agents Objective and Subjective properties integration	57

4.3 The role of identity in intelligent exchanges _____	58
4.4 Chapter Summary _____	60
<i>Chapter 5: Subjective Intelligent Systems Ontologies Applications</i> _____	62
5.1 Formal and applied ontology _____	62
5.2 ALMA Ontology Matching Techniques _____	67
5.3 Legal Intelligent Subjective Systems Application Ontology _____	69
5.4 LKIF Legal Ontology framework _____	71
5.5 Chapter Summary _____	72
<i>Chapter 6: ALMA Subjective Intelligent System Test Model</i> _____	73
6.1 ALMA multi-agent architecture environment description and set-up _____	73
6.2 ALMA Model Artefact Architecture _____	78
6.3 Legal ontology conversion to Jade Java beans ontology _____	82
6.4 Chapter Summary _____	89
<i>Chapter 7 ALMA Model Subjective Communication Analysis</i> _____	91
7.1 ALMA Single Subjective Multi-agent Cluster Model _____	91
7.2 ALMA Single Subjective Cluster A1 Data Analysis _____	93
7.3 ALMA Single Subjective Cluster A2 Data Analysis _____	98
7.4 ALMA Double Subjective Multi-agent Cluster Model _____	101
7.5 ALMA Double Subjective Cluster B1 Data Analysis _____	103
7.6 ALMA Double Subjective Cluster B2 Data Analysis _____	112
7.7 Externalisation of subjective properties analysis _____	121
7.8 Chapter Summary _____	123
<i>Chapter 8: Conclusions</i> _____	126
8.1 Research Background _____	126
8.2 Research Conclusions _____	129
8.3 Research Contribution _____	131
8.4 Future Research _____	133
<i>Bibliography</i> _____	135
<i>Appendix A: List of Publications</i> _____	147
<i>Appendix B: Protégé Ontology Editor</i> _____	148
<i>Appendix C: JADE Agent Development Environment</i> _____	151
<i>Appendix D: LKIF JADE ALMA Classes</i> _____	158
<i>Appendix E: Eclipse Java IDE</i> _____	183
<i>Appendix F: Agent ALMA and Cogito Ontology Code Java Code</i> _____	209
<i>Appendix G: PiersonvPost Legal Case</i> _____	214
<i>Glossary</i> _____	223

List of figures

<i>Number</i>	<i>Page</i>
FIG. 1 MULTIDISCIPLINARY RESEARCH LAYOUT	5
FIG. 2 THESIS STRUCTURE.....	20
FIG. 3 SUBJECTIVE MULTI-AGENTS TAXONOMY	27
FIG. 4 ACTIVITY THEORY MODEL.....	46
FIG. 5 MULTIPLE AGENTS TOOL MEDIATED ACTIVITY MODEL.....	47
FIG. 6 ONTOLOGY TAXONOMY (JAQUETTE 2002)	63
FIG. 7 AGENT ONTOLOGY COMMUNICATION	68
FIG. 8 LEGAL ONTOLOGY RESEARCH STRUCTURE.....	79
FIG. 9 ALMA EXPERIMENT STRUCTURE	80
FIG. 10 ALMA AGENT CLUSTER MODEL.....	81
FIG. 11 PROTÉGÉ ONTOLOGY EDITOR.....	83
FIG. 12 PROTÉGÉ ONTOLOGY NETBEANS CONVERTER	84
FIG. 13 COGITO ONTOLOGY IN PROTÉGÉ FORMAT	85
FIG. 14 OBJECTIVE AGENT PROCESS.....	87
FIG. 15 ALMA AGENT PROCESS	88
FIG. 16 SUBJECTIVE AGENT MODEL.....	89
FIG. 17 ALMA SUBJECTIVE MULTI AGENT MODEL	92
FIG. 18 JADE SNIFFER MESSAGES STRUCTURE EXPERIMENTS A1-A2.....	93
FIG. 19 DA0-OBJECTIVE- ALMA AGENT EXCHANGES.....	94
FIG. 20 ALMA AGENT FIRST EGOCENTRIC COMMUNICATION.....	95
FIG. 21 ALMA-SELF-SUBJECTIVE AGENTS EXCHANGE	96
FIG. 22 SUBJECTIVE- DA0 AGENT EXCHANGE.....	97
FIG. 23 DA0-OBJECTIVE MESSAGE EXCHANGE	98
FIG. 24 EGOCENTRIC COMMUNICATION PROCESS.....	99
FIG. 25 EXTERNALISATION COMMUNICATION PROCESS.....	100
FIG. 26 EXPERIMENT B META-AGENTS ARCHITECTURE	102
FIG. 27 EXPERIMENT B1 DIAGRAM.....	104
FIG. 28 EXPERIMENT B1 COMMUNICATION MODEL HISTORY	104
FIG. 29 EXPERIMENT B1 FIRST INTERNALISATION PROCESS	105
FIG. 30 FIRST B1 EGOCENTRIC MESSAGE EXCHANGE.....	106
FIG. 31 TEST B1 EGOCENTRIC MESSAGE.....	107
FIG. 32 ALMA2 INTERNALISATION PROCESS.....	108
FIG. 33 ALMA2 ONTOLOGICAL SHIFT PROCESS	109
FIG. 34 ALMA2 EXTERNALISATION PROCESS.....	110
FIG. 35 AGENTS SUB2 EXTERNALISE TO OBJ AND DA1.....	111
FIG. 36 EXPERIMENT B2 DIAGRAM.....	112
FIG. 37 MODEL B2 COMMUNICATION FLOW	113
FIG. 38 MODEL B2 STARTING QUERY	114
FIG. 39 MODEL B2 ALMA CLUSTER INTERNALISATION PROCESS.....	115
FIG. 40 MODEL B2 ALMA CLUSTER EGOCENTRIC COMMUNICATION.....	116
FIG. 41 MODEL B2 EXTERNALISATION PROCESS.....	117
FIG. 42 AGENT OBJ2 INTERNALISATION PROCESS	118
FIG. 43 AGENT ALMA2 EGOCENTRIC VALIDATION PROCESS	119
FIG. 44 MODEL B2 AGENT SUBJ2 EXTERNALISATION PROCESS	120
FIG. 45 SUBJECTIVITY MATRIX	122
FIG. 46 PROTÉGÉ ONTOLOGY EDITOR.....	149
FIG. 47 ONTOLOGY BEANS GENERATOR PLUG-IN.....	150
FIG. 48 JADE AGENT DEVELOPMENT ENVIRONMENT	153
FIG. 49 JADE DF REGISTER WINDOW	154

FIG. 50 JADE DUMMY AGENT MESSAGE FORM.....	155
FIG. 51 JADE SNIFFER AGENT WINDOW	156
FIG. 52 JADE INTROSPECTOR AGENT WINDOW	156
FIG. 53 JADE PLATFORM.....	157
FIG. 54 JADE ALMA LEGAL ONTOLOGY	158

A c k n o w l e d g m e n t s

I wish to thank the University of Canberra School of Information Sciences & Engineering and the Dean of School Professors Dharmendra Sharma, for the assistance given during the research period 2000-2007. I wish also to sincerely thank Professor Craig McDonald for his appreciated scientific stimulation and valuable academic suggestions on critical times.

Particular thanks to my supervisor Associate Professor Masoud Mohammadian for the academic and personal support given during the research period. Finally I wish to thank my wife Maria for her infinite patience and support during the whole research period.