



**The Australia-New Zealand School of Government**  
**at the University of Canberra**

**POLICY-ORIENTED LEARNING AND OPENING UP:  
THE CASE OF CHINA IN TRANSITION**

**BY**

**YANZHE ZHANG**

**Ph. D. THESIS**

**2014**

# Abstract

This thesis aims to make a theoretical, empirical and prescriptive contribution to the contemporary study of policy transfer. In the first regard, it observes that despite bold claims to the contrary (see Dolowitz and Marsh, 1996; and Evans, ed., 2010), most studies of policy transfer are characterised by their mono-cultural understanding of the process of policy-oriented learning reflected in an obsession with the destination of transfer rather than its original policy setting or settings. This betrays an absence of strong comparative investigation of the process of learning. Moreover, existing approaches to the study of policy transfer networks (the process of policy learning) are limited by their narrow epistemological perspectives as in the main they tend to lend undue focus on actors, ideas/interests or structure. Following the work of Marsh and Smith on policy networks (2000), this thesis contends that these elements cannot be separately analyzed. It therefore advances an interactive model of policy transfer networks that investigates the process of learning through three interactive dimensions: between structure and agents, network and context, and network and outcome.

This brings me to the thesis's second main contribution – the presentation of original case study explorations of the role of policy transfer in facilitating the rise of the Quasi-Competition State. The thesis contends that policy transfer has become a key policy instrument in the process of transition from a command to a market socialist economy. Indeed, in order to meet the perceived imperatives of state transformation, the 'Reform and Open Door' policy has been featured by a broad range of processes of policy learning. It is, however, beyond the scope of this thesis to present a comprehensive description and explanation of this complex and multi-faceted reform process, rather the aim of this account is to provide an examination of certain processes of policy transfer which are broadly indicative of the dynamics of change underpinning the incremental process of reform.

The third and final contribution of this thesis lies in its identification of the ingredients of rational policy transfer which can hopefully help guide future Chinese policy-makers to more progressive policy outcomes.

# Table of Contents

	Pages
Abstract .....	I
Acknowledgements .....	X
List of Abbreviations .....	XII
List of Boxes, Figures, Charts and Tables .....	XV

## Part One: Theory-Building

Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
1.1.Preamble – Policy Transfer and the Rise of the New China.....	1
1.2.What is Policy Transfer and What Role does it play in the Chinese State? .....	4
1.3.The Core Hypothesis.....	6
1.4.Research Questions.....	7
1.5.Theory Building .....	8
1.6.Empirical Investigation.....	10
1.7.Methodology .....	12
1.8.The Structure of the Research.....	12
1.9.Contribution .....	14
1.10. Audience .....	15
Chapter 2: Debating Policy Transfer .....	17
2.1. Introduction.....	17
2.2. What is Policy Transfer?.....	18
2.3. Conceptual Origins .....	22
2.4. Approaches .....	24
Formal Transfer Analysis .....	24
Ideational Approaches .....	29

Policy Diffusion Studies .....	30
Inclusive Approaches.....	31
2.5. The Limits of Policy Transfer Analysis.....	32
2.6. The Way Forward .....	33
The Structure/Agency Problem.....	34
Designing Instruments of Policy oriented Learning .....	35
Evaluative Methods – determining the success or otherwise of processes of policy learning .....	36
2.7. In Conclusion – Understanding Policy Transfer.....	38
Chapter 3: Chinese Development – a History of Pragmatic Policy Learning?.....	40
3.1. Introduction.....	40
3.2. The Age of Isolation (1600-1850) .....	42
3.3. The Westernisation Movement (1860 to 1912) .....	44
3.4. Civil War and the Conflict between ‘Westernization’, ‘Russification’ and ‘Localization’ (1912 to 1949).....	48
3.5. Policy Learning and the “Reform and Open Door” Policy.....	51
The Mao Legacy (1949-1979) .....	53
Box 2.1. A Profile of Chinese Government and Politics .....	54
The Marketization of the State in the Shadow of Hierarchy (1982 to 2002).....	58
Rolling Back the Frontiers of the State.....	58
Rolling Back the Institutions of the Planned Economy .....	60
Chart 2.1. Institutional Engineering in China 1981-2008.....	61
Decentralisation .....	61
The New Public Management.....	63
Public Service-oriented Government (2003-2008).....	64
Towards a Harmonious Society (2008 to the present).....	68
3.6. Processes of Learning .....	71
Chapter 4: Research Design – Operationalizing Policy Transfer Network Analysis .....	74
4.1. Introduction.....	74
4.2. Ontological and Epistemological Questions.....	76
4.3. Methodological Puzzles .....	79
Investigating Processes of Policy Learning .....	79
Studying Policy Transfer Networks.....	82

Validating and Measuring Success in Processes of Policy Transfer .....	84
4.4. Research Methods.....	87
The Case-Study Method .....	89
Data Collection .....	91
Methodological Problems .....	94
4.5. Research Ethics.....	95
4.6. In Conclusion.....	96

## **Part Two: Case Study and Analysis**

Chapter 5: Human Resources Development in China – the Case of the China Europe Public Administration Programme (CEPA).....	97
5.1. Introduction.....	97
5.2. The China National School of Administration and Public Sector Reform.....	100
The Main Functions of the China National School of Administration.....	102
Training.....	102
Research and Consultancy .....	103
The Structure of the Chinese National School of Administration .....	104
International Cooperation .....	104
Summary.....	105
5.3. The Emergence and Development of the China-Europe Public Administration Programme.....	106
Origins.....	107
Aims.....	108
5.4. Policy-oriented Learning through a Policy Hub – the Case of the China-Europe Public Administration Programme .....	111
Problem Recognition and the Search for Solutions .....	112
Contact .....	116
The Emergence of an Information Feeder Network .....	117
Cognition, Reception and the Emergence of a Policy Transfer Network.....	118
Elite and Cognitive Mobilization.....	120
Interaction .....	121
Evaluation, Decision and Implementation.....	124
5.5. Validating Policy Transfer.....	127
Subject of Analysis .....	127

Agents of Transfer .....	127
The Evidence of Transfer.....	128
The Evidence of Non-transfer.....	129
The Degree of Transfer.....	130
5.6.In Conclusion .....	131
Policy Transfer Networks and Policy Change.....	132
Constraints Confronted in the Process of Policy Transfer.....	134
Implications for Practice.....	135
Chapter 6: Policy Transfer, Pensions and Long-term Care Policy in China.....	137
6.1.Introduction.....	137
6.2.The Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security.....	140
Main Functions .....	141
Organisational Structure .....	142
International Cooperation and Communication.....	143
Summary .....	144
6.3. The Origins of the Present Crisis.....	145
The ‘One Child Policy’ .....	145
New Demographic Patterns .....	147
Culture Shift.....	149
6.4.The Process of Policy-oriented Learning.....	150
Sources of Learning.....	152
The Emergence of a Policy Transfer Network .....	154
Policy Aims.....	154
Implementation Perspective.....	157
6.5.Understanding China’s ELCP as an Imperfect Process of Policy-Oriented Learning.....	158
6.6.In Conclusion – Muddling on, not yet through.....	162
Chapter 7: Policy Transfer and Banking Sector Reform – the Case of Strategic Management.....	165
7.1.Introduction.....	165
7.2. Banking Sector Reform and Policy Learning .....	167
7.3. The ‘Reform and Open Door Policy’ and Banking Sector Reform.....	168

7.4. WTO Membership and Banking Sector Reform .....	169
The Main Functions of the Banking Sector .....	170
Providing High Quality Loans .....	170
Liberating the Administrative Burden on Banks .....	171
The Structure of the Banking Sector .....	171
7.5. The Rise of Strategic Management in China’s Banking Sector .....	172
Context .....	173
Policy Aims .....	175
Banking Sector Reform as a Product of Transfer .....	176
Establishing Western Banking Practices in China .....	177
Problem Definition .....	179
Searching for Solutions .....	180
The Origins of Reform .....	181
7.6. Implementation Perspective .....	183
Agents of Policy Transfer .....	184
The Evidence of Transfer – “this is all about control” .....	185
Obstacles to Implementation .....	187
7.7. Applying the Policy Transfer Network Model .....	188
7.8. In Conclusion .....	190
Chapter 8: Policy Transfer and Property Management in China .....	192
8.1. Introduction .....	192
8.2. The Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development .....	195
Research and Consultancy .....	198
International Cooperation .....	199
Summary .....	199
8.3. The Emergence and Development of China’s Property Management Programme .....	200
8.4. China’s Property Management as a Product of Policy Oriented Learning .....	204
Problem Definition .....	205
The Search for Solutions .....	207
Property Management in Britain .....	208
8.5. Programme Implementation .....	210
Programme Barriers .....	212



8.6. Policy Outcomes .....	213
8.7. Applying the Policy Transfer Network Approach .....	215
8.8. In Conclusion .....	219
Chapter 9: Economic Harmonisation and the World Trade Organisation – the Case of China’s Growth Enterprises Market .....	220
9.1. Introduction .....	220
9.2. The Origins of China’s Capital Market .....	222
The Shanghai Stock Exchange (SHSE) .....	224
The Shenzhen Stock Exchange (SZSE) .....	225
H-Shares .....	226
9.3. The China Securities Regulatory Commission (CSRC) .....	228
The Main Functions of the China Securities Regulatory Commission .....	229
Supervising and Regulating .....	230
Research and Consultancy .....	230
The Structure of the China Securities Regulatory Commission .....	231
9.4. The Emergence of the Growth Enterprise Market Board .....	231
Problem Recognition .....	233
The Search for Ideas .....	238
Lessons from NASDAQ and AIM .....	239
9.5. Establishing the GEM – an Implementation Perspective .....	243
The Preparatory Phase .....	244
Market Impact .....	246
9.6. Understanding China’s Growth Enterprises Market as a Process of Policy-Oriented Learning .....	248
9.7. In Conclusion .....	251

### **Part Three: Theoretical Findings**

Chapter 10: Comparing Policy Transfers .....	254
10.1. Introduction .....	254
10.2. Comparing Processes of Learning .....	256
Explaining Policy Transfer .....	257
Agents of Policy Transfer .....	260
The Objects and Degrees of Transfer .....	263

Barriers to Transfer .....	264
10.3.Measuring Success.....	268
10.4. Identifying the Components of a National Learning Culture .....	272
10.5.In Conclusion – Avoiding the ‘Learning Paradox’ .....	275
Chapter 11: In Conclusion – Why Ideas and Bounded Rationality Matter in Policy Transfer .....	277
11.1. Introduction.....	277
11.2. Research Findings.....	278
Understanding the Process of Learning .....	278
Measuring Success in Policy Transfer .....	281
11.3.Theoretical Implications .....	283
11.4.Strengths and Weaknesses of the Research Design.....	284
11.5. Lessons for Practice .....	286
11.6.Avenues for Future Research.....	288
11.7. End Games .....	289
 Bibliography .....	 291
Internet References .....	316
Primary Case Study Resources .....	319
Appendix.....	325

# Acknowledgements

In submitting this thesis I would like to acknowledge those who have helped and supported me along this journey. Most significantly, my supervisor Professor Mark Evans and his family have been a constant source of support in the ten years I have known them, not only while I have been writing this thesis in Australia, but also prior to that in the UK. I am grateful for their patience, guidance and care both on and off campus. It is my honour to witness Dylan from his birth to being a top scorer on the football pitch. Likewise, I thank staff and fellows in the Australia and New Zealand School of Governance, Institute of Government for providing an excellent research environment.

I am very grateful to the people for supporting my research while I am doing it in China. The civil servants in Liaoning province P.R.China were always helpful and supportive during my time there. The professionals in the China Academy of Governance and Renmin University (especially Professor Dong Keyong and Professor Xu Yaotong) were enormously helpful in facilitating access to academic networks. As were all those who allowed themselves to be interviewed for this research. This research would not have been what it is without their support.

Above all, I owe much to my family and friends for helping me, encouraging me and staying with me through this long and often lonely journey from the hopeless beginning to what I hope to be a happy ending. In particular, my parents have supported me with hesitation through these four years. Without them, none of this would have been possible.

# Abbreviations and Acronyms

ACFTU	All-China Federation of Trade Union
AIMs	Alternative Investment Market
BRIC	Brazil, Russia, India and China
CAF	Common Assessment Framework
CAG	China Academy of Governance
CBMO	Chicago Building Managers Organization
CEA	China Enterprise Association
CEIBS	China Europe International Business School
CEPA	China Europe Public Administration Program
CNSA	China National School of Administration
COD	Central Organization Department of CPC Central Committee
CPC	Communist Party of China
CPMI	China Property Management Institute
CSRC	The China Securities Regulatory Commission
EC	European Commission
ECD	European Commission Delegation in Beijing
ELCP	Endowment and Long-term care Program
EIPA	European Institute of Public Administration
ENA	French National School of Administration
EU	European Union
FER	Final Evaluation Report of the CEPA Program
FOIA	Freedom of Information Act
GEM	Growth Enterprise Market
HSBC	Hong Kong and Shanghai Banking Corporation

ILO	International Labor Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOs	International Organizations
IPOs	Initial Public Offerings
JVs	Joint Ventures
KASDAQ	Korean Association of Securities Dealers Automated Quotation
LTCs	Long Term Care Systems
M&A	Merger and Acquisitions
MCA	Ministry of Civil Affairs
MHRSS	Ministry of Human Resource and Social Security
MLSS	Ministry of Labor and Social Security
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOFCOM	Ministry of Commerce (China)
MOHURD	Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development
MOHRSS	Ministry of Human Resource and Social Security
MOP	Ministry of Personnel (China)
MBA	Master of Business Administration
MPA	Masters of Public Administration
MTER	Mid-term Evaluation Report of the CEPA Program
NASDAQ	National Association of Securities Dealers Automated Quotation
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organizations
NPOs	Non-Profit Organizations
NHS	British National Health System
NPC	National People's Congress
NPM	New Public Management

OR	Operational Report
PA	Public Administration
PBOC	Peoples Bank of China
PIPA	Provincial Institute of Public Administration
QFIIs	Qualified Foreign Institutional Investors
SA	Strategic Alliance
SCOPSR	State Commission Office for Public Sector Reform
SEDZs	Special Economic Development Zones
SFES	Strict Foreign Exchange System
SHSE	Shanghai Stock Exchange
SOEs	State-Owned Enterprises
SMEs	Small and Medium-sized Enterprises
SSC	State Securities Commission
SZSE	Shenzhen Stock Exchange
TAC	Technical Assistance Service Contract For E.C. External Aid
TM	Training for Training Managers
TOR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training of Trainers
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
US	United States
WB	World Bank
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization

# List of Boxes, Charts, Tables and Figures

## Boxes

<i>Box 3.1. A Profile of Chinese Government and Politics</i>	54
<i>Box 5.1. Training programmes delivered by the CNSA</i>	103
<i>Box 5.2. The CEPA Programme</i>	109
<i>Box 5.3. Explaining Policy Transfer in the Case of CEPA</i>	132
<i>Box 6.1. Services Delivered by the MOHRSS</i>	141
<i>Box 6.2. The Main Components of the ELCP</i>	155
<i>Box 6.3. Explaining Policy Transfer in the Case of ELCP</i>	159
<i>Box 6.4. The Process of Policy Learning Underpinning the Transfer of the ELCP</i>	161
<i>Box 6.5. Reform Chronology</i>	163
<i>Box 7.1. Explaining Policy Transfer in the Case of Banking Sector Reform</i>	188
<i>Box 7.2. The Process of Policy Transfer in China's Banking Sector Reform</i>	190
<i>Box 8.1. The Structure of the Ministry</i>	194
<i>Box 8.2. The Ministry's Core Tasks</i>	197
<i>Box 8.3. Explaining Policy Transfer in the Case of China's Property Management System</i>	215
<i>Box 8.4. The Process of Policy Transfer Underpinning the Reform of the Property Management System</i>	217
<i>Box 9.1. Supervising and Regulating Function of CSRC</i>	228
<i>Box 9.2. Comparison of Listing Rules</i>	231
<i>Box 9.3. The Five Components of the GEM Programme</i>	235
<i>Box 9.4. Explaining Policy Transfer in the GEM Case</i>	249
<i>Box 9.5. The Process of Policy Learning Underpinning the Transfer of GEM</i>	251
<i>Box 10.1. Explaining policy transfers</i>	258
<i>Box 10.2. Understanding the process of learning</i>	260

## Charts

<i>Chart 3.1. Institutional Engineering in China 1981-2008</i>	61
--	----



## Tables

<i>Table 4.1.</i> The characteristics of policy transfer networks	83
<i>Table 4.2.</i> Differences between qualitative and quantitative research	88
<i>Table 4.3.</i> Indicators for Comparing Policy Networks	94
<i>Table 10.1.</i> Dimensions of policy success	269
<i>Table 10.2.</i> Measuring the success of the case study sample	272

## Figures

<i>Figure 4.1.</i> The emergence and development of a voluntary policy transfer network	84
<i>Figure 4.2.</i> Mapping potential obstacles to processes of policy transfer	86
<i>Figure 6.1.</i> The Decline in Fertility Rates in China	147
<i>Figure 10.1.</i> Mapping obstacles to the processes of policy transfer	264