



Understanding the Concept of Governance in Tourism Policy

Development: A Case Study of Taiwan (1895-2008)

Tzu-Wen (Carol) Hsu

**Master of Marketing, University of Western Australia, Australia
Bachelor of Arts in Journalism, National Cheng-Chi University, Taiwan**

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Management

**Tourism Management
Faculty of Business and Government
University of Canberra**

March 2011

Abstract

This research purported to look into the governance mechanisms that had driven the Taiwan government's policy and its influence in the development of its tourism industry. The research focused on the country of Taiwan as a case study. Given the complex and the unique nature of the industrial development in Taiwan including tourism, the research attempted to capture the key elements of change at policy and industry levels in Taiwan tourism by developing an integrative framework. This theoretical framework aimed to integrate elements of literature of coordination (Thompson, Frances *et al.*, 1991), public policy (John, 1998), development theory (Amsden and Chu, 2003) and literature of tourism policy (Hall and Jenkins, 1995). This framework was used as a theoretical tool to analyse and deconstruct historical data about the evolution of Taiwan tourism industry and detailed the policy information as specific programs. A critical part of this analysis was the identification of governance mechanisms in tourism policy and their influence in the development of the tourism industry. The research found that hierarchical top-down modes of governance dominated policy development in the period 1950-2000, and this type of governance has been at least responsible for the lack of development of tourism, particularly as an export-oriented sector. Since 2000, a dramatic change has been initiated in the way the government had viewed the tourism industry in Taiwan. The government had encouraged more collaborative and networked governance model, at least in terms of policy implementation. The main reason for this change was the complexity and size of the new plan where the government had recognised the fact that it did not have the capacity to make a successful implementation. Political objectives, however, were important drivers of the content of the new plan. Finally, this research suggested some policy initiatives which may suit better Taiwan's tourism development.

To my beloved brother and sister:

Chun-Hsiung Hsu 許俊雄 (1976 - 2007)

Susan Hsiu-O Hsu 許秀娥 (1970 - 2008)

Acknowledgements

This seem-never-finished journey has finally come to the end and I must now try to recall all the people to whom I am indebted for helping make this research possible. Surely I will miss someone so I apologise in advance for any omissions; they are not intentional.

First, I would like to thank the chair of my supervisory panel, Associate Professor Robert Inbakaran for his intellectual inputs and faith in me. His encouragement is the main driving force to make this thesis possible. I am also grateful to the Sustainable Tourism CRC (STCRC) and the Faculty of Business and Government at University of Canberra which provided financial support during some part of the time of my candidature. My appreciations extend to Ms. Sue Uzabeaga for her assistance in administrative matters and to the Faculty copyeditor, Ms. Lourdes (Lulu) Turner, for her efforts in proving reading my thesis draft.

I also would like to present a special thanks to my previous supervisors, Associate Professor Brent W. Ritchie, Professor Jenny Stewart, and Professor Donald Lamberton for their early guidance in the formation of my research idea. Although I was not able to follow them to the new institution, I am still grateful for their unreserved supports.

Many people in Taiwan also contribute to the completion of this thesis. Without them, I would not be able to puzzle out Taiwan's tourism development. They are from:

- Taiwan Tourism Bureau: Senior Executive officer Christine Lai (賴麗幸), Section Chief Lin Pei-Chun (林佩君) and former Deputy Director-General Steven T.Y. Kuo Su (郭蘇燦洋).
- Ministry of Economic Affairs: Ms. Kathy Ma (馬家蓉), Secretary Fang Yuan-Ming (方淵民), Ms. Li Yi-Ching (李怡靜) and Manager of MICE project office Jenneille Hsu (許懷元).
- Other institutions: Dean Mr. Su Cherng-Tyan (蘇成田) at College of Tourism Chung Hua University, A/Professor Lee, Peter Yi-Hung (李貽鴻) at School of Tourism Ming Chuan University, A/Professor Cheng-Kwan Yang (楊正寬) at Department of Tourism Providence University, Secretary General Thomas Tsou (鄒榮光) at Taiwan Convention & Exhibition Association, Chairman Yao Ta-Kuang (姚大光) at Travel Agent Association of R.O.C., Director Alan Sun (孫明台) and Chief Sectary Chen Yi-Chuan (陳怡全) at Travel Quality Assurance Association.
- Taipei Economic and Cultural Office in Australia (TECO): Representative Dr. Gary Song-Huann Lin (林松煥), Director of Economic Division Tong I-Min (童益民), and Director of Information Division Jerry Chuang (莊正安) and many more staff of the overseas branches in Taiwan Tourism Bureau.

My great thank you goes to my 83-year-old grandmother (許彩雲) for all her unconditional support and affections in this long journey. I am deeply indebted to my daughters, Anna and Angelina, as well as my husband, Antonio. During the difficult period of this journey, without their understanding, love, support and company, this research surly would be abandoned. I apologise for the absent from many family activities. I dedicate this thesis to them and welcome a new family member, Antonia, to share this happy moment in March 2011.

Table of Content

ABSTRACT	i
CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP OF THESIS	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENT	xi
LIST OF TABLES.....	xv
LIST OF FIGURES	xvii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 RATIONALE	1
1.2 WHY STUDY TAIWAN’S TOURISM POLICY?	3
1.2.1 <i>Why compare Taiwan’s manufacturing policy and tourism policy?</i>	6
1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	7
1.4 A POLICY ANALYSING FRAMEWORK	8
1.5 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES.....	10
1.6 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS	12
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW: FRAMING AND CONNECTING CONCEPTS– TOURISM AND POLICY –.....	13
2.1 INTRODUCTION	13
2.2 TOURISM	14
2.2.1 <i>Supply components</i>	20
2.2.2 <i>Economic impact of tourism</i>	23
2.2.3 <i>Destination imaging and marketing</i>	28
2.3 POLICY	32
2.3.1 <i>Tourism policy studies</i>	36
2.4 INDUSTRY DEVELOPMENT IN EAST ASIA	42
2.4.1 <i>Government-led market approach</i>	42
2.4.2 <i>Neoclassical approaches</i>	44
2.4.3 <i>Government-private networks approaches</i>	46
2.5 GOVERNANCE.....	47
2.5.1 <i>Why the governance concept is useful</i>	48
Governance: as a central concept	56
2.5.2 <i>Modes of governance</i>	57
Hierarchy leadership	57
Market failure approach	60
Networks	67
2.6 RESEARCH FRAMEWORK.....	70

CHAPTER 3 METHODS	79
3.1 INTRODUCTION	79
3.2 RESEARCH HYPOTHESIS	80
3.3 RESEARCH DESIGN	81
3.4 DATA SOURCES AND PURPOSE	82
3.4.1 <i>Primary data collection</i>	82
3.4.2 <i>Secondary data collection</i>	84
3.4.3 <i>Design of the case study</i>	85
3.4.4 <i>Methodological considerations</i>	86
3.5 A POLICY ANALYSIS FRAMEWORK	88
CHAPTER 4 POLICY EVOLUTION AND TAIWAN TOURISM DEVELOPMENT.....	93
4.1 INTRODUCTION	93
4.2 JAPAN’S FOUNDATIONS AND INFLUENCE ON TAIWAN: 1895-1945	96
4.3 KMT ON TAIWAN AND GENESIS OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT: 1945-60	98
4.4 EXPORT ORIENTATION AND BIRTH OF INBOUND TOURISM: 1961-70.....	106
4.5 THE CRISIS PERIOD AND CENTRALISATION OF TOURISM POLICYMAKING: 1970-79	116
4.6 THE GROWTH OF DOMESTIC TOURISM AND POLICY DISARTICULATION: 1980-89	124
4.7 SUPPORTING LOCAL TOURISM: 1990-99	130
4.8 TOURISM AS A KEY INDUSTRY: 2000-08	137
4.9 CONCLUSION	148
CHAPTER 5 CASE STUDY— DOUBLING TOURIST ARRIVALS PLAN.....	153
5.1 INTRODUCTION	153
5.2 ANTECEDENTS OF THE DOUBLING TOURIST ARRIVALS PLAN (DTAP) PROGRAM	154
5.3 KEY TARGETS OF DOUBLING TOURIST ARRIVALS PLAN (DTAP)	156
5.4 DOUBLING TOURIST ARRIVALS PLAN: THE POLICY PROCESS	158
5.5 DOUBLING TOURIST ARRIVALS PLAN: PHILOSOPHY AND ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN	162
5.5.1 <i>Revamping Tour-Package Routes</i>	164
5.5.2 <i>Develop new tour packages-tour routes and new scenic spots</i>	166
5.5.3 <i>Plan to build inexpensive hotels in Taipei metropolitan area and scenic areas</i>	167
5.5.4 <i>Plan to upgrade general hotel quality</i>	172
5.5.5 <i>Physical Service Facilities-Transportation</i>	174
5.5.6 <i>International tourism promotion and branding</i>	177
5.5.7 <i>Promotion strategy for target markets</i>	186
5.6 EVALUATING DTAP SUCCESS	190

CHAPTER 6 ANALYSIS OF THE POLICY PROCESS IN TOURISM.....193

6.1 INTRODUCTION..... 193

6.2 EXPLANATION OF THE FRAMEWORK APPLICATION..... 194

 6.2.1 *Governance modes* 194

6.3 HIERARCHICAL GOVERNANCE 196

 6.3.1 *Tourism in the context of top-down national priorities*..... 196

 6.3.2 *Political platform: driver for policy making* 202

 6.3.3 *Knowledge in bureaucracy*..... 205

 6.3.4 *Limited industry influence in tourism*..... 207

6.4 MARKETS’ GOVERNANCE 209

 6.4.1 *Markets as principle guiding government intervention* 209

 6.4.2 *Markets as governing structure in tourism* 211

 The example of Taiwan night markets 211

 BOT Models for developing tourism infrastructure..... 216

6.5 NETWORKS GOVERNANCE 217

 6.5.1 *Government networks in tourism* 217

 6.5.2 *The case of implementing DTAP* 219

6.6 EXPLAINING TOURISM INDUSTRY OUTCOMES 221

6.7 CONCLUSION 230

CHAPTER 7 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....233

7.1 INTRODUCTION..... 233

7.2 RECAPPING RESEARCH QUESTIONS 234

7.3 CONTRIBUTIONS TO LITERATURE..... 237

7.4 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS 239

 7.4.1 *Innovation-empowered ‘night markets’* 241

 7.4.2 *‘Paradise shopping’ for high technology products*..... 242

 7.4.3 *World-class innovation museums*..... 242

7.5 FUTURE RESEARCH..... 243

REFERENCES 245

APPENDIX A: PLAYERS IN TAIWAN'S TOURISM SECTOR

List of Tables

Table 2-1: Forecasts of International Arrivals	24
Table 2-2: Comparison of Neo-classical Approach and Neo-Austrian Approach.....	61
Table 2-3: Definitional Models of Governance - Hierarchies, Markets, and Networks	73
Table 2-4: Principles of Enquiry: Hierarchies-Markets-Networks	77
Table 3-1: Methodological Considerations for this Research	87
Table 3-2: Principles of Enquiry: Hierarchies-Markets-Networks	88
Table 3-3: Definitional Models of Governance - Hierarchies, Markets, and Networks	90
Table 4-1: Number of Visitors and Tourism Revenue in Taiwan (1956-1969).....	111
Table 4-2: Number of Visitors and Growth Rate in Taiwan (1970-1981).....	120
Table 4-3: The Average Hotel Occupancy Rate: 1975-85	128
Table 4-4: Taipei Lantern Festival*	135
Table 5-1: International Tourist Arrivals & Market Share in the Region of Asia & the Pacific (1990-2000).....	154
Table 5-2: Numbers of Visitors in Taiwan (2000-2002).....	156
Table 5-3: Budget Allocation for the “Challenge 2008 - National Development Program” (2002-2007).....	160
Table 5-4: Strategies and Measures in Doubling Tourist Arrivals Plans	163
Table 5-5: Numbers of International Hotels and Tourist Hotels in Taiwan.....	168
Table 5-6: Average Tourist Hotel Room Rate in Taiwan (1998-2003)	168
Table 5-7: Projects of Private Participation in Tourism Construction (2001-2008).....	172
Table 5-8: Taiwan inbound visitors (1995-2005)	181
Table 5-9: A List of Tourism Bureau’s Overseas Branches in 2008	183
Table 5-10: Tourism Bureau’s Promotion Budget (1991-2001).....	186
Table 5-11: Doubling Tourist Arrivals Plan (2002-2008)-Performance Indicators.....	191
Table 6-1: Definitional Models of Governance - Hierarchies, Markets, and Networks	195
Table 6-2: New Taiwan by Design Projects.....	221
Table 7-1: Framework for the Formulation of Recommendations	241

List of Figures

Figure 1-1: Asia Countries' Tourism Revenue as % of GDP	4
Figure 1-2: Taiwan's Tourism Revenue as % of GDP (1956-2008).....	4
Figure 1-3: Research Diagram	8
Figure 1-4: A Guiding Framework for Tourism Policy making Analysis	9
Figure 2-1: The Tourism Business	19
Figure 2-2: Research Framework	71
Figure 2-3: Diagram of the Influence of Policy Actors in the Structure of Governance	75
Figure 4-1: Taiwan's Tourism Revenue as % of GDP (1956-1969).....	112
Figure 4-2: Number of Travel Agencies and Tourist Guides (1956-1974).....	115
Figure 4-3: Inbound Visitors in Taiwan (1956-1974).....	115
Figure 4-4: Number of Business and Pleasure Visitors in Taiwan (1972-1982)	122
Figure 4-5: Changes in Taiwan's Tourism Policy Administration	149
Figure 4-6: National Development Plans Affecting Taiwan's Tourism Industry.....	150
Figure 5-1: Responsible authorities and plans of 2004Taiwan Visit Year	180
Figure 5-2: Taiwan Tourism Touch Your Heart Logo and CI.....	187
Figure 5-3: Naruwan, Welcome to Taiwan Logo	188