



Partnership for Development: Alternative Approaches to Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh

Nilufa Akhter Khanom

MPA (UC), Grad. Dip (Admin), BA (Econ), MSc (Psych), BSc (Hon)

Partnership for Development: Alternative Approaches to Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh

Nilufa Akhter Khanom

MPA (UC), Grad. Dip (Admin), BA (Econ), MSc (Psych), BSc (Hon)

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy
University of Canberra**

2011

© Nilufa A. Khanom 2011

Abstract

Poverty has been identified as one of the world's biggest problems. The international community recognises that reducing global poverty is one of the major development challenges of the twenty-first century. The problem of poverty is particularly severe in Bangladesh, where a variety of poverty alleviation initiatives have been tried. The most recent one involves Public Private Partnerships (PPPs), which are collaborations between partners in different sectors. PPPs are assumed to be effective for reducing poverty as they are seen to optimise the use of scarce resources, promote economic growth and enhance efficiency. The Government of Bangladesh has recognised the use of PPPs as an innovative and effective approach for poverty alleviation in Bangladesh. This thesis addresses this major policy issue by examining the novel arrangements of PPPs to determine how this approach can assist in alleviating poverty.

This research explores different PPP arrangements for poverty alleviation in Bangladesh and evaluates the performance and effects of these PPPs. It identifies opportunities and constraints affecting these PPPs. This research utilises the multiple-case study methodology, examining two cases namely, the Income Generation for Vulnerable Group Development (IGVGD) and Rural Micro Credit (RMC) PPPs that have been introduced in Bangladesh as poverty alleviation measures.

The thesis also identifies the rationale, features and mechanisms of the IGVGD and RMC PPPs using interviews with key persons who were involved in the policy making and the design and implementation of the PPPs.

Different stakeholders were also asked about the effects of the PPPs and suggestions for their improvement. The beneficiaries were also asked about the economic and social changes to their lives as a result of the PPPs.

A model of PPPs for poverty alleviation is developed from the literature on the subject and then used to analyse the data from the Bangladesh case studies.

Acknowledgements

It has been a great honour and privilege to have Professor Mark Turner as my supervisor and mentor. I am extremely indebted to him for his sincere guidance throughout my study with his in-depth knowledge and extensive experience. His dedication, understanding and encouragement have assisted me to accomplish my thesis very successfully and to overcome many obstacles.

I am grateful to all academics and administrative staff of the Faculty of Business and Government, University of Canberra, for their continuous support of me.

I am particularly grateful Professor Deborah Blackman, Associate Dean (Research), Faculty of Business and Government for her sincere support to me. I am also very grateful to Lulu Turner, casual copyeditor, in the Faculty of Business and Government.

I am extremely thankful to my younger brother Jewel for his enormous help and support during data collection and for making my research successful.

My heartfelt thanks to my parents Mr. Niaz Mohammed Khan and Mrs. Jamila Khatun who have always provided me the best educational opportunities that have led me to be where I am today.

Finally, but most importantly, the greatest support and understandings that I have received and valued has come from my family: my beloved husband Rana; my dearest daughters and son Monon, Medha and Nabeel. They have enabled me to achieve the successful completion of my thesis. Your support has been invaluable.

To my family

List of Publications from this Thesis

Journals

- 2011** Khanom, NA 2011, 'Improving the effects of public private partnerships (PPPs) on ultra-poor households in Bangladesh', *International Review of Business Research Papers*, vol. 2, no. 1.
- 2010** Khanom, NA 2010, 'Conceptual issues in defining public private partnerships (PPPs)', *International Review of Business Research Papers*, vol. 6, no. 2.

Conferences

- 2010** Khanom, NA 2010, 'Improving the effects of public private partnerships (PPPs) on ultra-poor households in Bangladesh', *13th International Business Research Conference*, 22–24 November 2010, Melbourne, Australia, ISBN no. 978-0-9804557-1-7.
- 2010** Khanom, NA 2010, 'The effects of public private partnerships (PPPs) on ultra-poor households in Bangladesh: Evidence from the IGVDG programme', *ANZSOG Institute for Governance Seminar Series*, University of Canberra, Australia.
- 2010** Khanom, NA 2010, 'The effects of public private partnerships (PPPs) on ultra-poor households in Bangladesh: Evidence from the IGVDG programme', *Ten Years of 'War Against Poverty': What We Have Learned Since 2000 and What Should We Do 2010–2020?* University of Manchester, UK.
- 2009** Khanom, NA 2009, 'Conceptual issues in defining public private partnerships (PPPs)', *Asian Business Research Conference*, 11–12 April 2009, Dhaka, Bangladesh, <<http://www.wbiconpro.com/14%5B1%5D.-Nilufa.pdf>>

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT	V
FORM B CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP OF THESIS	VII
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IX
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS FROM THIS THESIS	XIII
TABLE OF CONTENTS	XV
LIST OF TABLES	XXI
LIST OF FIGURES	XXIII
LIST OF ACRONYMS	XXV
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
THE PROBLEM OF POVERTY.....	1
SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS RESEARCH	4
AIMS OF THIS RESEARCH	5
STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS	6
2. LITERATURE REVIEW.....	9
THE ORIGINS OF PPPS	9
DEFINING PPPS	12
<i>PPPs as Tools of Governance or Management.....</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>PPPs as Tools of Financial Arrangements</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>PPPs as Tools of Development Process.....</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>Pro-poor PPPs.....</i>	<i>17</i>
PPPS IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES	18
<i>Public Demand.....</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>Role of NGOs in Market Mechanism</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>Role of International and Development Agencies.....</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>Bureaucratic Dysfunction</i>	<i>20</i>
<i>Government Motivation</i>	<i>21</i>
<i>PPPs are Politically Safe</i>	<i>21</i>
<i>Indirect Impact of New Public Management.....</i>	<i>21</i>
PPP MECHANISMS IN DEVELOPING COUNTRIES	22
<i>Nature of Partnerships Arrangement.....</i>	<i>22</i>
<i>Initiators of PPPs.....</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Duration of PPPs.....</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>Types of PPPs</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>Stakeholders Involved in PPPs</i>	<i>26</i>

Partnership For Development: Alternative Approaches to Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh

<i>Roles of Different Stakeholders in PPPs</i>	27
WHY PPPS ARE THOUGHT TO BE EFFECTIVE FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION	29
<i>PPPs Bring New Resources</i>	29
<i>PPPs Bring Productivity Gains</i>	30
<i>The Challenges for PPPs</i>	32
A MODEL OF PPPS FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION	34
<i>Description of the Figure</i>	35
3. POVERTY AND DEVELOPMENT IN BANGLADESH	39
HISTORICAL AND GEOGRAPHICAL BACKGROUND OF BANGLADESH.....	39
DEVELOPMENT CHALLENGES IN BANGLADESH	42
<i>Health</i>	42
<i>Education</i>	43
<i>Water and Sanitation</i>	44
<i>Gender Equity</i>	46
POVERTY AND BANGLADESH.....	46
<i>Definitions of Poverty</i>	46
<i>Poverty as Deprivation</i>	47
<i>Poverty Trends in Bangladesh</i>	48
POVERTY ALLEVIATION PROGRAMMES IN BANGLADESH	51
PPP PROGRAMMES FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION IN BANGLADESH.....	53
<i>Income Generation for Vulnerable Group Development</i>	54
<i>Rural Micro-Credit (RMC) PPP of the PKSF</i>	58
4. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	65
CASE STUDY APPROACH	65
<i>Selection of Cases</i>	67
<i>Mixed Methods of Data Collection in Case Study Design</i>	68
DATA COLLECTION.....	70
<i>Primary Data</i>	70
<i>Secondary Data</i>	73
DATA ANALYSIS.....	73
LIMITATIONS OF THIS RESEARCH.....	74
5. RATIONALE, FEATURES AND MECHANISMS OF PPPS FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION... 77	
THE RATIONALE FOR PARTNERSHIPS TO ALLEVIATE POVERTY IN BANGLADESH.....	77
DEFINING FEATURES OF PARTNERSHIPS	82
<i>IGVGD</i>	82
<i>RMC</i>	84
THE PARTNERSHIP MECHANISMS OF THE IGVGD AND THE RMC.....	87
<i>Types of Partnerships Arrangements</i>	87

Having set out respondents' views of the types of partnership arrangements, the next section reports the findings on the PPP stakeholders and perceptions of their roles in the IGVD and the RMC. 88

Stakeholders Involved in the IGVD and the RMC..... 88

Roles of the Stakeholders and Resource-sharing in the IGVD and the RMC PPPs..... 89

DURATION OF PPPS..... 92

STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESS OF DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS 93

Views of the Government Respondents on the Strengths and Weaknesses..... 93

Views of the PKSF Executives on the Strengths and Weaknesses..... 96

Views of the NGO Executives on Strengths and Weaknesses..... 99

Experts' Views on Strengths and Weaknesses of the Government 100

Views on the Weaknesses of the Beneficiaries 101

CONTRIBUTION OF THE STAKEHOLDERS ON THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS 101

Views of the Government Officials on the Decision-Making Process..... 101

Views of the PKSF Executives on the Decision-Making Process..... 102

Views of the NGO Executives on the Decision-Making Process..... 103

Experts' Views on the Decision-Making Process..... 104

RISKS IN PPPS 105

Types of Risks..... 106

6. PERFORMANCE OF THE PPPS..... 111

STAKEHOLDERS' VIEWS ON THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PPPS 111

Common Views on Performance on both the IGVD and the RMC..... 111

Views on the Performance of the IGVD..... 113

Views on the Performance of the RMC..... 115

OPPORTUNITIES AND CONSTRAINTS OF THE IGVD AND THE RMC PPPS 117

Opportunities of the PPPs..... 117

Constraints on the PPPs 118

Constraints on Policy Design..... 119

Constraints in Implementation of the PPPs 123

Views of the Beneficiaries on Constraints..... 128

Other Constraints on the Success and Performance of the PPPs 131

7. EFFECTS OF THE IGVD PPPS ON POVERTY ALLEVIATION 135

FINDINGS FROM INTERVIEWS..... 135

FINDINGS FROM SURVEY AND OBSERVATIONS 140

DEVELOPMENT STATUS OF THE SAMPLE IGVD HOUSEHOLDS 143

Income and Expenditure 143

Food Security..... 145

IGA Skills Training 147

Savings and Assets Acquisition..... 148

Land Ownership..... 150

<i>Loans</i>	151
<i>Human and Social Development</i>	153
8. EFFECTS OF THE PPPS ON POVERTY ALLEVIATION IN BANGLADESH: EVIDENCE	
FROM THE RMC	159
FINDINGS FROM THE INTERVIEWS.....	159
FINDINGS FROM SURVEY AND OBSERVATIONS	162
DEVELOPMENT STATUS OF THE SAMPLE RMC HOUSEHOLDS	167
<i>Income and Expenditure</i>	167
<i>IGA Skills Training</i>	169
<i>Food Security</i>	172
<i>Savings and Assets Acquisitions</i>	174
<i>Loans</i>	176
<i>Amount of Debts</i>	177
<i>Human and Social Development</i>	178
9. WAYS TO IMPROVE THE PPPS FOR POVERTY ALLEVIATION IN BANGLADESH.....	183
WAYS TO IMPROVE THE IGVD	183
<i>Suggestions from the IGVD Beneficiaries</i>	189
THE WAYS TO IMPROVE THE RMC.....	190
<i>Suggestions from the RMC Beneficiaries</i>	195
<i>Suggestions on Some Common Issues of the PPPs</i>	196
10. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION.....	203
RATIONALE FOR THE PPPS	203
DEFINING FEATURES OF THE IGVD AND THE RMC PPPS.....	204
THE PARTNERSHIP MECHANISMS OF THE IGVD AND THE RMC.....	206
<i>Types of Partnerships Arrangements</i>	206
<i>The Stakeholders Involved in the IGVD and the RMC</i>	206
<i>Sharing of Resources in the IGVD and the RMC PPPs</i>	208
DECISION-MAKING PROCESS IN THE PPPS	208
RISKS IN PPPS	210
PERFORMANCE AND EFFECTS OF THE PPPS	213
<i>Performance of the IGVD PPP</i>	213
<i>Performance of the RMC PPP</i>	214
EFFECTS OF PPPS	215
<i>Income and Expenditure</i>	215
<i>Food Security</i>	219
<i>Savings and Assets Acquisition</i>	221
PERFORMANCE AND EFFECTS OF LOANS AND RATES OF INTEREST	223
<i>Effects of Loans</i>	223

Partnership For Development: Alternative Approaches to Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh

<i>Attitudes to Rates of Interests</i>	224
<i>Effects of Income-Generating Activities Skills Training</i>	225
<i>Human and Social Development</i>	226
OPPORTUNITIES AND CONSTRAINTS OF THE PPPS	229
<i>Opportunities</i>	229
<i>Constraints to the PPPs</i>	231
11. CONCLUSION	241
APPENDICES	249
APPENDIX A: QUESTIONS FOR SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS	249
APPENDIX B: SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRES	251
APPENDIX C: SELECTIONS OF SAMPLE, DATA COLLECTION PROCEDURE AND NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS	257
REFERENCES	261

List of Tables

Table 1.1: Comparative data on development and poverty in South Asian countries	2
Table 3.1: Bangladesh at a glance	39
Table 3.2: Under-five mortality rate (per thousand live births).....	43
Table 3.3: Net enrolment in primary school, net enrolments for girls, survival to grade 5 and gross enrolment .	44
Table 3.4: Access to safe drinking water in Bangladesh	45
Table 3.5: Access to sanitary latrines in Bangladesh.....	45
Table 3.6: Bangladesh data on poverty and development	49
Table 3.7: Trend of income poverty: population below national poverty lines	50
Table 3.8: Annual rates of poverty reduction (%) over 1990–2007	50
Table 3.9: PKSF’s trainings provided to staff of POs.....	61
Table 5.1: Rationale of partnerships for poverty alleviation in Bangladesh	78
Table 5.2: Defining features of partnerships in the IGVD and the RMC	84
Table 5.3: Views of respondents on the defining features of partnerships	85
Table 5.4: Partnership arrangements of the IGVD and the RMC	88
Table 5.5: The stakeholders involved in the IGVD and the RMC	89
Table 5.6: Duration of the IGVD and the RMC	92
Table 5.7: Recognised strengths of different stakeholders	94
Table 5.8: Recognised weaknesses of different stakeholders	95
Table 5.9: Types of risk in the IGVD and the RMC PPPs.....	105
Table 6.1:Stakeholders views on constraints on the PPPs at policy design	120
Table 6.2: Stakeholders views on constraints on PPPs in the implementation stage	127
Table 6.3:Beneficiaries views on constraints on the PPPs for beneficiary development.....	131
Table 7.1: Characteristics of sample IGVD households	141
Table 7.2: Characteristics of sample IGVD participants	142
Table 7.3: Income earning members of the IGVD households in FY2008–09.....	143
Table 7.4: Monthly average income of the sample IGVD households in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09.....	144
Table 7.5: Per-capita daily income in US\$ of the sample IGVD households in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	144
Table 7.6: Comparison of monthly average income and expenditure of the sample IGVD households in FY2008–09	145
Table 7.7: Average monthly household food expenditure in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	146
Table 7.8: IGA skills training undertaken in the IGVD programme during FY2007–08	147
Table 7.9: Assets and valuable items bought by the sample IGVD households in FY2008–09	149
Table 7.10: IGVD beneficiaries’ views on the rates of interest of NGOs loan.....	153
Table 7.11: School enrolment in 2008 and 2009 and immunisation conditions in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09 of the sample IGVD households’ children	153
Table 7.12: IGVD participants’ knowledge on general treatments for diarrhoea and tuberculosis in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	154
Table 8.1: Characteristics of the sample RMC households	163

Partnership For Development: Alternative Approaches to Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh

Table 8.2: Characteristics of the sample RMC beneficiaries	164
Table 8.3: Earning members in the sample RMC households	166
Table 8.4: Monthly average income of the sample RMC households in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	167
Table 8.5: Per-capita daily income in US\$ in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	168
Table 8.6: Comparison of the monthly income and expenditure in FY2008–09 of the sample RMC households	169
Table 8.7: Monthly food expenditure of the sample RMC households in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	173
Table 8.8: Amount of debts of the sample RMC beneficiaries in FY2008–09.....	178
Table 8.9: School enrolment in 2008 and 2009 and immunisation conditions in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09 of the sample RMC households’ children.....	179
Table 8.10: Comparison of RMC beneficiaries’ knowledge on general treatments for diarrhoea and tuberculosis in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	179
Table 8.11: Access of RMC sample households to safe drinking water in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	180

List of Figures

Figure 2.1: Model of PPP for poverty alleviation in Bangladesh	35
Figure 3.1: The location of Bangladesh in South Asia	40
Figure 3.2: Map of Bangladesh	41
Figure 4.1: Mixed method triangulation in embedded multiple case study approach	69
Figure 7.1: A tricycle (Rickshaw Van) of an IGVDG beneficiary	139
Figure 7.2: A group of IGVDG beneficiaries	142
Figure 7.3: Changes in food intake in the sample IGVDG households during FY2008–09.....	147
Figure 7.4: Monthly income earned in FY2008–09 by the IGVDG households utilising IGA skills training ...	148
Figure 7.5: Savings of the sample IGVDG households in FY2008–09.....	149
Figure 7.6: A well-off IGVDG participant in her vegetable garden	150
Figure 7.7: Ownership of cultivatable and residential land by the IGVDG households in both FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	151
Figure 7.8: Loans received from the NGOs by the sample IGVDG participants during FY2008–09	152
Figure 7.9: Perception of the sample IGVDG beneficiaries on the rate of interest of the NGOs’ loans	152
Figure 7.10: Source of drinking water of the IGVDG households in FY2007–08 and	155
Figure 7.11: Housing and surroundings of an IGVDG beneficiary	156
Figure 7.12: Sanitation conditions of the sample IGVDG households in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	156
Figure 7.13: An NGO’s training session to the IGVDG beneficiaries on family planning	157
Figure 7.14: A training poster on family planning	158
Figure 8.1: A group of RMC beneficiaries	165
Figure 8.2: Number of years of enrolment in the RMC by its beneficiaries	166
Figure 8.3: Percentages of the sample RMC participants who received IGA skills training from the NGOs	170
Figure 8.4: An RMC beneficiary in her poultry farm.	171
Figure 8.5: Monthly income utilising IGA skills training of the sample RMC households in FY2008–09	172
Figure 8.6: Changes in food intake among the sample RMC households in FY2008–09 compared to FY2007–08	173
Figure 8.7: Amount of savings of the sample RMC households in FY2008–09	174
Figure 8.8: Properties/assets and valuable household items bought by the sample RMC households in FY2008– 09	175
Figure 8.9: Loan-receiving behaviour of the sample RMC households in FY2008–09	176
Figure 8.10: Beneficiaries’ views on the interest rates of the NGO loans of the sample RMC households	177
Figure 8.11: RMC beneficiaries’ views on the rates of interest of the NGO loans.....	177
Figure 8.12: Sanitation conditions of the sample RMC households in FY2007–08 and FY2008–09	180
Figure: 10.1 Risk in PPPs in poverty alleviation	212

List of Acronyms

Acronym	Full Title
ADB	Asian Development Bank
ADBI	Asian Development Bank Institute
AGM	Assistant General Manager
AMC	Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation
ASA	Association of Social Advancement
BARD	Bangladesh Academy of Rural Development
BBS	Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics
BRAC	Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
BRDB	Bangladesh Rural Development Board
CBN	Cost of Basic Need
CBOs	Community-Based Organisations
CCDA	Centre for Community Development Assistance
CDC	Community Development Council
CIRDAP	Centre on Integrated Rural Development for Asia and the Pacific
CVD	Comprehensive Village Development
DCI	Direct Calorie Intake
DGM	Deputy General Manager
DS	Deputy Secretary
DSS	Department of Social Services
DWA	Department of Women Affairs
FD	Finance Division
FIMS	Financial and Information Management System
FMS	Financial Management System
FSVGD	Food Security for Vulnerable Group Development
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GK	<i>Gonoshahasthaya Kendra</i>
GM	General Manager
HDI	Human Development Index
HDR	Human Development Report

HIES	Household Income and Expenditure Survey
HNP	Health and Nutrition Programme
HPI	Human Poverty Index
ID	Institutional Development
IG	Income-generating
IGA	Income-generating Activities
IGVGD	Income Generation for Vulnerable Group Development
LGUs	Local Government Units
MC	Micro Credit
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MFI	Micro Finance Institutions
MD	Managing Director
MoA	Memorandum of Agreement
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MPI	Multidimensional Poverty Index
MRA	Microcredit Regulatory Authority
MWCA	Ministry of Women and Children Affairs
MWCI	Manila Water Company Incorporated
NER	Net Enrolment Rate
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
NNP	National Nutrition Programme
NPM	New Public Management
NWSDP	National Water Supply and Drainage Board
PFI	Private Finance Initiatives
PKSF	Palli Karma Shahayak Foundation
PLDP	Participatory Livestock Development Programme
PIO	Project Implementation Officer
PO	Partner Organisation
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
RID	Rural Infrastructure Development
RMC	Rural Micro Credit
SDI	Society for Development Initiatives

Partnership For Development: Alternative Approaches to Poverty Alleviation in Bangladesh

SSNP	Social Safety Net Programme
Tk.	Taka [Bangladeshi Currency]
TPSB	<i>Tubig Para Sa Barangay</i>
UNESCAP	United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
UN	United Nations
UNO	<i>UpaZilla Nirbahi Officer</i>
UP	Union <i>Parishad</i>
US	United States (of America)
VGD	Vulnerable Group Development
WAO	Women Affairs Officer
WFP	World Food Program
YD	Youth Development